

FINAL REPORT ON THE UNESCO WORKSHOP ON NOMINATIONS TO THE LISTS OF THE 2003 UNESCO CONVENTION FOR THE SAFEGUARDING OF THE INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE.

Held at the Shilpakala Academy, Dhaka, Bangladesh, 5 – 9 May 2018

Prepared by the facilitators: Noriko Aikawa and Suzanne Ogge

Submitted: 9 June 2018



Introduction

The workshop was the third in a series organized by the UNESCO Dhaka Office within the framework of a two-year project aimed at strengthening national capacities for the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage (ICH). Funded by the UNESCO/Azerbaijan Funds-in-Trust, the project¹ is implemented by UNESCO Dhaka in cooperation with the Ministry of Cultural Affairs (MoCA), the Department of Archaeology, Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy and other stakeholders.

The first workshop took place in January/February 2017 on implementing the 2003 Convention, and the second in September 2017 on community-based inventorying. The present workshop focused on nominations under the Convention, with a focus on the Urgent Safeguarding (USL) and Representative Lists (RL). A final workshop is slated for September 2018, with a focus on safeguarding.

The facilitators wish to thank the UNESCO Dhaka Office, and especially Ms Beatrice Kaldun, Director, and Ms Kizzy Tahnin, for their strong support with all aspects of the workshops, from giving informed advising on content to assuring smooth logistics throughout.

¹ The full project title is 'The UNESCO/Azerbaijan Funds-in-Trust project for Safeguarding National Capacities for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage for Sustainable Development in Bangladesh.'

1. COUNTRY CONTEXT

1.1 Introduction to the Cultural Context

Note: Section 1.1 of this report draws on the information given in the previous two workshop reports.² The authors of this report note that as the information remains valid at the time of the nominations workshop, the text remains largely the same, with some minor modifications.

The majority of Bangladesh's population of approximately 167 million are Muslims (87%), followed by Hindus (12%), Buddhists (1%), Christians (0.5%) and Sikhs (less than 1%). Islam is the official religion. Ninety-eight percent of the population speak Bangla, with the 54 indigenous ethnic minorities, including the Chakmas, the Marmas, the Tripuris, the Mros, and the Santals, among others, speaking their own languages.

Bangladesh has ratified the ILO Convention 107 on Indigenous and Tribal Populations, but not the ILO Convention 169, and it abstained from voting on the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. As such, it does not recognize its ethnic minorities as 'indigenous' peoples with the corresponding rights. Rather, Article 23A of the Constitution refers to indigenous peoples as 'tribes, minor races, ethnic sects and communities.' The Constitution provides for affirmative action for indigenous peoples and prohibits discrimination inter alia on grounds of race, religion or place of birth. (Article 23A: 'the State shall take steps to protect and develop the unique local culture and tradition of the tribes, minor races, ethnic sects and communities').

Bangladesh's intangible cultural heritage (ICH) reflects the religious and ethnic diversity of the country, which has incorporated and amalgamated influences of Islam, Hinduism, Buddhism and Christianity, as well as other belief systems. Music and performing arts include classical forms with historical links to the Indian subcontinent, such as Bharatha Natyam and Manipuri, as well as other diverse musical forms such as the Baul, Marfati, and and Murshidi. Rituals and social practices include widely celebrated festivals such as the Muslim holidays of Eid ul-Fitr and Eid ul-Adhha, as well as the Hindu celebration of Durga Puja, which is joined by Hindus and Muslims alike, and the Buddha Purnima. The many ethnic groups practice diverse social and religious practices relating to nature and the universe, without direct associations with the major religions. Craft traditions in Bangladesh are enormously varied, and include terracotta sculpture, Kantha embroidery and Jamdani weaving, Madur mat weaving, Alpana floor paintings, and brass-smithing, among many others.

Taking into account that participant discussions during the two previous workshops tended to focus more on traditions relating to the performing arts and crafts according to the reports, the present workshop sought to encourage the participants to consider the wider reach of the domains of ICH referred to in the definition of the Convention, notably social practices and knowledge of nature and the universe.

Within the framework of the present workshop, it was not possible to gain deep understanding of the cultural context in country or the many factors influencing living traditions among such large and diverse population. What was evident is that communities in in Bangladesh, like others worldwide, are experiencing significant shifts in their living traditions due the impacts of modernization, growing consumerism and the use of social media and communication technologies, internal and external migration, environmental factors including climate change and the degradation of the natural environment, and various other factors.

These factors make the 2003 Convention and the role of UNESCO ever more pertinent as a key mechanism for working, in coordinated ways, to safeguard its ICH.

² More specifically, the information contained in section of 1.1 of this report draws in part on the reports submitted for the capacity-building workshops on the implementation of the 2003 Convention (January/February 2017) and on community-based inventorying under the Convention (September 201, authored by the facilitators, Ms Noriko Aikawa and Dr Alexandre Denes.

1.2 POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENTS SINCE THE LAST WORKSHOP

a. Legal frame work: Constitution and Acts

The following paragraphs give an overview of the legal framework of the country, as understood by the facilitators.

The Constitution of the People's Republic of Bangladesh enacted in 1972 states in its Article 23 that, 'The State shall adopt measures to conserve the cultural traditions and heritage of the people, and so to foster and improve the national language, literature and the arts that all sections of the people are afforded the opportunity to contribute towards and to participate in the enrichment of the national culture.' Article 24 that, 'The State shall adopt measures for the protection against disfigurement, damage or removal of all monuments, objects or places of special artistic or historic importance or interest.'

Under these provisions of its Constitution, the Bangladesh Government has enacted various Acts, Ordinances and Policies to protect and promote its diverse cultural expressions. They include the Antiquities Act (1968), Bangla Academy Ordinance (1978), National Archive Ordinance (1983), Bangladesh National Museum Ordinance (1983), Nazrul Institute Ordinance (1984), Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy Act (1989), Bangladesh Folk Art and Crafts Foundation Act (1998), Copyright Act (2000), Bangladesh National Cultural Policy (2006), Small Ethnic Groups Cultural Organization Act (2010) and the Bangla Academy Act (2013) .

b. Cultural Policy

According to the Periodic Report submitted to UNESCO by Bangladesh on 'Measures to Protect and Promote the Diversity of Cultural Expressions,' (in relation to the 2005 UNESCO Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions) submitted in 2013, the Ministry of Cultural Affairs provides the framework for an overall cultural policy. This policy, it notes, sets the objectives, financial frameworks, subsidy arrangements and the organizational structures that form the basis of cultural policy in Bangladesh. Its main objectives are referred to as:

- Protect and promote all cultural expressions in Bangladesh, regardless of caste, class, religion, origin etc.;
- Develop cultural activities and integrate culture and economic development;
- Protect, preserve and develop cultural elements of small ethnic groups, and ;
- Meet the wave of globalization and mitigate negative effects.

The report refers to the Cultural Policy introduced in 2006, stating that it has been implemented through the 17 organizations under the auspices of the Ministry of Cultural Affairs and in coordination with other ministries such as the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Children and Women affairs and Ministry of Industries. Reference is also made to the Bangladesh Government allocating 28,005,524 USD for implementation of this policy through government agencies and NGOs in the period 2011/2012. Information is not available to the facilitators regarding more recent expenditure.

Despite the above references to this policy, during the workshop on CBI in September 2017, Ms Shahana Zaman, then Deputy-Secretary of MOCA, mentioned during that it was still in draft form. The policy's draft status was again confirmed during the present workshop (May 2018), suggesting some contradictions with the information in the above-mentioned report.

c. Periodic Report

The Periodic Report from Bangladesh for the 2003 Convention was due in 2016 and submitted in December 2017. It refers to a National Inventory of ICH in a publication entitled: 'Living Traditions' which resulted from a survey conducted in 2007 by the Asiatic Society, with the financial assistance of the Government. Also referred to are the institutions directly involved in the implementation of the 2003 Convention: the Bangla Academy, Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy, the Bangladesh National Museum and the Bangladesh Arts and Craft Foundation.

Representatives from each of these institutions attended the present workshop, and as during discussions, one of the shortfalls of the actions referred to in the Period Report is the inventorying process to date in Bangladesh. For example, the document submitted for a nomination currently under evaluation consists of publication by the Bangla Academy entitled, 'Ten Elements of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Bangladesh: A Study Based on the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage.' The publication is problematic does not meet the 2003 Convention's requirements of inventorying, such as continual updating and wide representation. Rather, it is a finalized publication limited to ten elements described in a manner in line with the key fields of information given on the sample questionnaire produced for the CAP materials, aimed representing nominations.

d. Nominations

To date, Bangladesh has nominated the following files, with two among them having been withdrawn/referred:

- **2008:** RL, Baul songs (proclaimed in 2005 as Masterpiece of Oral and Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity).
- **2013:** RL, Traditional Art of Jamdani Weaving
- **2014:** RL, Nokshin Kante , withdrawn at the last moment because of the insufficiency of the section 5 of the nomination form requiring information on inventorying.
- **2015:** RL, Jatra: recommended for referral because of the insufficiency in the sections 1.2.3.4 and 5 of the form.
- **2016:** RL, Mangal Shobhajatra on Pahela Balshakh: recommended for referral due to the insufficiency of the section 5 of the form, but nonetheless inscribed by the IC.
- **2017:** RL, Traditional Art of Shital Pati weaving of Sylhet, inscribed.
- **2018:** RL, Rickshaws and Rickshaw Painting in Dhaka City: presently under evaluation for a decision this year.

e. Other Actions:

Candidature to the Intergovernmental Committee for the Safeguarding of the ICH (IC):

Bangladesh submitted a candidature for membership of the IC at the 7th General Assembly to be held in June 2018, yet was not elected. Bangladesh failed to be elected.³

f. Pilot Inventorying Project

Consistent with the priority given to inventorying projects under the UNESCO Capacity-building Programme (CAP) for the Convention and as a follow-up activity to the community-based inventory workshop held in September 2017, the UNESCO Dhaka Office supported a community-based inventorying initiative in the framework of the same project supporting the

³ Bangladesh was placed at the fifth place with 64 votes.

present training workshop. This initiative was timely and beneficial in the present context whereby groundwork for developing future inventories is needed. The NGO Shadhona and the National Crafts Council of Bangladesh (NCCB) were contracted to carry out two main tasks with the involvement of the Shilpakala Academy; the first, a collaborative desk study relating to existing documentation and current support mechanisms of ICH in Bangladesh. The second, a pilot

community-based field project to explore possible inventorying methodologies. The contract specified that fieldwork take place in the Syhlet district, with each organization focusing on different ICH domains as defined by the Convention: Shadhona on oral traditions and expressions, performing arts and social practices, rituals and festive events, and the National Crafts Council of Bangladesh on elements relating to knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe and traditional craftsmanship. The activities took place from December 2017 to March 2018. Shilpakala Academy also organized a training workshop for its young staffs of its different district branch offices in inventory making with community participation. The deliverables from NCCB and Shadhona constitute references for future inventorying activities in Bangladesh.

g. Other considerations

Bangladesh will hold general elections this year, the consequences of which are likely impact on the support for and interest in the 2003 Convention. In addition, the Joint – Secretary for Culture, who attended the workshop and expressed strong support for the Convention, might also be posted to another agency in the near future. These changes of personnel could be of course anticipated, but can influence the degree of support for the Convention within the Ministry.

2. LESSONS LEARNT FROM THE WORKSHOP PREPARATION

2.1 Advanced and thorough preparation

Strong preparation ensured the smooth implementation of the workshop. The Dhaka Office provided ready support to the facilitators throughout the process. Over several Skype sessions beginning over three months prior to the training, the facilitators developed the programme with the support and input of the Dhaka Office (refer to Annex 1). Reference documents and presentations were sent in advance and the participants' files were well-organized by the Dhaka Office, facilitating the use of the materials throughout the training.

Delays in finalizing some administrative issues (the contract and invitation letter) were settled at the last moment due to internal constraints. This created some stress around the purchase of flight tickets and the obtaining visas, but all ended well.

2.2 Participant numbers

The facilitators requested that the number of participants be limited to 20, with the intention of optimizing the time available to address nominations in depth, given the often heavy-going content of this particular workshop; the need to explain the nomination procedures, the forms, and so forth. As is often the case, it is not easy for Field Offices (FOs) to limit numbers or to ensure a diversity of participants (for example, a higher representation of community members and diverse ethnic groups). Some 34 participants joined the present workshop, as recommended by the national authorities (refer to section 3.3 below and to the list of participants, Annex 2). Fortunately, the dynamics of the group worked well in terms of the learning, despite the numbers.

3. CONDUCT OF THE WORKSHOP, WITH A SPECIFIC FOCUS ON STRONG POINTS AND CHALLENGES

3.1 Strong points:

a. A good balance in the programme

As advised by the UNESCO Dhaka Office and by Noriko Aikawa (following their experience in the previous workshop in Dhaka on community-based inventorying), the facilitators developed a programme which included a substantial amount of group work and ample room for open discussions. Overall, a good balance was struck between more theoretical sessions conveying the mechanisms of nominations, case studies of real nominations which the participants found engaging, group work sessions and plenaries.

b. Working with a 'live file': 'The Rickshaws and Rickshaw Painting in Dhaka City': RL nomination.

Working with the above file from Bangladesh and currently under evaluation proved to be particularly effective.

During the preparation of the workshop, the facilitators and the FO discussed introducing a session during which the above nomination would be presented as an example of a weaker file, as comparing it to a stronger one, the Yama, Hoko, Yatai

Float Festivals of Japan (RL 2016). We took the decision to do this comparison early on day 2, as it could then set the scene for the remainder of the workshop by giving participants a very practical and current insight into the nomination process. This proved to be a good decision, as this session really jolted the group into giving their undivided attention.

The critique and comparison of both files was thorough, and this exercise illustrated just how attentive participants can be when dealing with a case study that is relevant to their heritage and the current situation in the country concerning both nominations and the level of understanding of the Convention in general. For example, through the comparison of the two nomination files, participants could better understand the need to focus on the enactment and transmission of traditions rather than the objects they produce (in this case, rickshaw painting), as well as the need for a bottom-up and more inclusive approach to community participation in nominations. The discussions ensuing from the session are described further in Section 4, Day 2 below.

This exercise also drew a particular attention of the Joint-Secretary of MOCA who expressed his appreciation of the approach taken to comparing and 'dissecting' the Rickshaw file, so as to better appreciate the importance of mastering the appropriate nomination methods.

3.2 Challenges:

The workshop went very well, with few challenges other than the tendency of some participants to let fly publically their gripes about MOCA's lack of efficiency in implementing the Convention and other actions relating to its mandate. These 'mini outbursts' revealed that MOCA has not been taking a strong position in promoting the implementation of the 2003 Convention through the various cultural institutions under its responsibility. On a positive note, the Joint Secretary from

MOCA, Mr. Mahbubur Rahman, remained present and engaged throughout the training, listening calmly to such concerns, and showing a clear interest in developing a stronger nomination for Bangladesh.

3.3 Participants' profiles

As mentioned above, a total of 34 participants took part in the workshop (refer to Annex 1: List of Participants). Under the instruction of the Minister of MOCA, ten high officials from MOCA including the Joint Secretary, two Deputy Secretaries, one senior Assistant Secretary and one Assistant Secretary attended the workshop. Participants also included three representatives from the Department of Archaeology, two from the Folk Art and Craft Foundation, two from the Bangladesh National Museum, three from the Shilpakala Academy including the Assistant Director, three experts from

Dhaka University, the Assistant Director of the Bangla Academy (two persons were invited, one attended), the President and General Secretary of the National Craft Council of Bangladesh (NCCB), three representatives of NGOs and a representative of Kothowain (NGO representing ethnic minorities in the CHT).

Among the participants, ten had attended the workshop on implementing the Convention in January 2017, and another ten had participated in the community-based inventorying workshop in September 2017. This was of course positive in terms of building greater continuity in the learning and enabled previous participants to guide the new ones to some extent.



The workshop venue and set up in Shilpakala Academy

3.4 Other resource persons' interventions (if relevant)

Not applicable.

3.5 Trainees' participation

In comparison with the previous workshops, the participants were more engaged in the discussions relating to the substance of the Convention, and notably those relating to community participation, sustainable development, ICH and Human Rights instruments, and ICH and gender. Some discussed organizational aspects of the implementation of the Convention in Bangladesh, referring for example to the attribution of roles among different institutions under MOCA. All supported MOCA taking a more sustained coordinating role among different institutions under its umbrella.



Joint Secretary for MOCA, Mr Mahbubur Rahman, and Mr Chandrasekhar Saha Artist and President, Bangladesh National Craft Council, c. UNESCO Dhaka Office

4. DESCRIPTION OF ACTIVITIES (ESPECIALLY GROUP WORK AND FIELD PRACTICUM)

DAY ONE

Ms Beatrice Kaldun, Director of UNESCO Dhaka Office, gave opening remarks presenting the workshop objectives and its context within the framework of UNESCO activities in Bangladesh. The Joint Secretary of MOCA then spoke, referring to the value of the workshop for all present in light of the overall lack of knowledge around safeguarding ICH in ways consistent with the 2003 Convention. He stressed that the workshop on nominations provided a timely and important opportunity for staff working under the institutions of MOCA to further their knowledge of both nominations, and ICH safeguarding. Noriko Aikawa next introduced the structure and agenda of the workshop, placing the training within the cultural context of Bangladesh.



Ms Beatrice Kaldun during the opening address (left) an participants during the introduction (right).
c. UNESCO Dhaka Office.

Session one: Noriko presented the UNESCO Convention for the safeguarding of the ICH and its key concepts, as well as the Ethical Principles to be respected while the safeguarding activities are conducted. The presentation was often interrupted by questions and discussions on the key issues such as community participation, human rights, sustainable development and gender appropriateness.

Session 2: The participants shared, in an open and discursive manner, their understanding of what constitutes ICH in Bangladesh and issues arising. One of the key issues to arise during this discussion was a lack of coordination among the cultural institutions responsible for ICH, and notably on the part of MOCA, as the overarching responsible agency, in relation to Shilpakala and Bangla Academies. The workshop – the facilitators pointed out – provided a good forum to further discuss constructive approaches to improving future coordination.

Session 3: Suzanne Ogge presented the session on identification and inventorying ICH, giving examples of various formats for inventories and case studies, including the IPHAN inventorying system from Brazil. Mindful of the challenges around inventorying in Bangladesh and the general lack of understanding about what inventorying under the Convention requires, the presentation balanced references to inventorying obligations under the Convention and practical case studies, while stressing the ultimate objective of inventorying as being to support safeguarding on the ground. An issue that had already come up when discussing the Rickshaw nomination, and in reference to other nominated files from Bangladesh, was the fact that none actually submitted inventory excerpts in line with the Convention. Rather, excerpts from a survey have been given (and accepted, for some reason). The point was also made during the session that Evaluation Bodies may not be as accepting of deficient inventory excerpts in future, taking note of the 2016 and 2017 IC reports and the number of files referred for inadequate responses to section 5 of the nomination forms.

Session 4: Due to the delay of the opening session, following sessions could not be held as scheduled. Noriko presented the overview of nominations, including the topic of mitigating undesirable consequence of the inscription. Two case studies that had been prepared for the session, ‘Rite of the Khalifan Kings’⁴ and ‘The Royal Court Music of Schrabistan’⁵ could not be presented due to the lack of time.

DAY TWO

At the outset of the day 2, the facilitators presented the comparison of two nominations, as referred to earlier in this report. The focus was mainly on showing the videos from each file for the purposes of their critiquing the content. This session also varied the teaching format while introducing participants to the video component of the nomination files.

Noriko began with the stronger file, ‘Yama, Hoko, Yatai Float Festival’ (Japan), inscribed on the Representative List in 2016 and selected by the IC as one of the 28 good examples of the nominations to the lists. The second video from the weaker file, ‘Rickshaws and Rickshaw painting in Dhaka City’, submitted by Bangladesh in 2017 and currently being evaluated for the eventual inscription in 2018, was then shown. Copies of the related nomination files had already been distributed to participants at the end of day 1.

The nomination ‘Yama Hoko Yatai Float Festival’ gave an example of a serial nomination compiling 32 different but similar urban festivals taking place in Japan. It was presented as one of the examples of how to resolve the limited number of nominations that States Parties are allowed to submit yearly to the Committee. It was also shown as a good example of how community members can initiate and participate in the preparation of a nomination.

The nomination video and form for ‘Rickshaws and Rickshaw Painting in Dhaka City’ unfortunately provided more an example of what not to do with a nomination. Prior to showing the video, one of the participants questioned whether it was appropriate to examine this nomination while it is being examined by the Evaluation Body, and given an open critique

⁴ Case Study 50 from the CAP repository.

⁵ Case Study 51 from the CAP repository.

of the file could offend the author. The facilitators pointed out that the file is already online, publically available, and that the authorship should not be exclusive to one person (though in this case, it is). The Joint Secretary of MOCA stressed that the participants should examine it as an efficient way to understand the criteria, expectations and mechanisms of nominations, given the group's familiarity with the element.

After the screening, Suzanne ran through the nomination file on screen, with comments tagged in bold text to various sections to facilitate the group's understanding of the problem areas. This, with the video and the 'Yama Hoko Yatai Float Festival file in their minds for comparison, enabled the participants to better understand shortfalls of the 'Rickshaw...' file, such as:

- The video was shot in 2013 and therefore some, if not much of its content, is no longer valid.
- The emphasis on the rickshaw paintings – the tangible outcomes of the element - rather than the process of enacting the tradition concerned.
- The need to take communities concerned in a wider sense than practitioners of the painting, which is the focus of this file. No reference is made to the drivers, the general community using the rickshaws.
- The reality of the rickshaw tradition and rickshaw painting declining (something that is not conveyed in the video) and the need to consider whether any nomination relating to rickshaws might be better suited to the USL rather than to the RL (as pointed out by the facilitators, rickshaws painting in Dhaka itself is declining, as is the very use of rickshaws due to road regulations and the lack of valid licenses, among other factors).
- The lack of any consideration of the human rights issues around the working conditions and health of rickshaw drivers.
- The lack of an acceptable inventory format, as already referred to above.
- The problem of referring to the file in relation only to Dhaka city when the tradition exists not only in other parts of Bangladesh, but in other Asian countries.

In **Session 5**, Suzanne presented the session, 'Introduction to the nomination forms and Aide-mémoires'. The focus was largely on the USL forms and participants were given an explanation of the form's sections, and were asked to consult the first 10 pages of the Aide Memoire for the USL. Case studies included the USL 2011 nomination for Xoan Singing of Phu Tho Province, Vietnam, which was chosen as it gave an example of the mechanism for transferring nominations from one list to another (with this nomination being the first to benefit from such a transfer, in this case, to the RL list in 2017). A brief overview was also given to the nomination form for submissions to the USL with international assistance (ICH-01 bis).

During the session, the facilitator also ran the participants through the relevant pages of the Website, demonstrating how to access/consult the lists of the Convention, the nomination forms and their instructions (each of which was included in the participant's kits) and other relevant resources, including the IC reports and decisions. The Aide-Memoires were particularly useful in conveying what the criteria of the nominations require, and common misinterpretations. Having already critiqued the rickshaw nomination facilitated the group's understanding of the messages in the Aide-Memoires.

Session 6: participants were split into four groups to examine the hypothetical nomination file from the CAP repository, 'The initial nomination for wooden bridge building in Glaristan'. The facilitators chose this mock file due to the relatively straightforward narrative in the nomination, which we felt was better suited to level of understanding of nominations among participants. We also chose to concentrate on a RL file, in light of the Rickshaw nomination being RL. Participants broke into four groups of six or seven, and worked intensively and with clear interest on the critique of the file.

Session 7: The groups presented with PPT the results of their evaluation guided by the Hand-out 2b: General Assessment of the initial bridges nomination. Among four groups the group IV appears to have best understood the nomination preparation methods. Through this exercise, we were able to gauge the weaker aspects of their overall grasp on nominations, and to hone the subsequent sessions to better address their needs. The facilitators critiqued each group presentation briefly, keeping in mind that the next session would involve the group reading over the final and stronger version of the mock nomination.



Kizzy Tahnin, Cultural Officer (standing, middle left image) and participants during group work, c. UNESCO Dhaka Office

DAY THREE

Session 8: Groups examined the final version of the Wooden Bridge Building nomination, comparing it with the initial nomination. The participants' feedback was positive; all had understood the purpose of the exercise and referred to it as having been useful.

Session 9: Suzanne presented the nomination of "Copper craftsmanship of Lahij" (Azerbaijan, RL 2016) as another example of a good nomination file. The group watched the video of the nomination followed by a summary of the key strengths in the nomination form. This case study seemed to capture the participants' interest and led to discussions around the metal-smithing 'lost wax' tradition in Bangladesh. The facilitators took this opportunity to encourage the group to use the UNESCO Website to search the lists of nominations and to conduct their own online searches into this exceptional resource.

Session 10: Suzanne presented 'Describing an element of ICH', presenting the participants with handout with summary samples from the CAP repository, along with examples from files online, and explaining the importance of describing the element and its enactment and transmission, as well as the communities concerned, geographical location, social functions and viability. The participants broke again into four groups, choosing a real tradition from Bangladesh, and referring to the CAP materials for additional guidance. The summaries of the groups were presented to the plenary meeting. The elements chosen were the followings:

Group 1: Gazir Gaan, singing traditions of rural communities in Bangladesh, currently in decline and traditionally practiced by people of all faiths in certain districts and during important events and for wishes of good fortune (such as for a child, after a cure, for the fertility of the soil, for the well-being of cattle, for success in business...)

Group 2: Lost Wax method: a form of casting metal from pieces first shaped in wax, baked in clay and then poured with metal; also a declining tradition faced with competition from plastic and other cheaper and quicker replicas.

Group 3: The Festivals of offerings of Shaon: Shaone Dala, a ritual performance by rural communities enacting the 'myths of Manasa,' (an ancient female Goddess of serpents, performed by healers) with rich oral and performance traditions that vary in style in different communities throughout the country.

Group 4: Jamail Mela: A traditional fair of son-in-laws in Tangail of Mymensingh (a district of Northern Bangladesh): according to the tradition, the married women with their husbands and children visit their paternal house.

Session 11: Noriko gave a presentation focusing on the need for safeguarding and approaches to preparing safeguarding plans, drawing on the Cap materials for this session, including: the hand-out, 'A step-by-step guide for developing safeguarding plans for ICH', case study 26 on safeguarding measures for a New Year festival (China), which gave an example of measures initiated by the State, and case study 23, which illustrates how a private initiative in Estonia has created effective paths to safeguarding through documentation and education.

Session 12: Suzanne presented a presentation on community involvement in nominations, which was based largely on original materials, with selected slides from the CAP materials. The presentation used examples of community-based and participatory field work, with documentation led by community members, and emphasized the need for cultural professionals to take the measures needed to facilitate real community involvement in all safeguarding measures including nominations. In Bangladesh, as elsewhere, this is not traditionally how things are done and the shift from government, researcher and expert-led work with living traditions will take time. An example of an RL nomination referred by the 2017 IC was shown, Falak Music. The presentation involved screening selected comments from the IC report, explaining the shortcomings in the file, notable for Criteria 4 focusing on community involvement in the nomination, and R5 on the inclusion of an inventory. The participants were then shown extracts from the IC's final decision for referral. This very practical approach – showing real files and their problems including the IC decision – seemed to sink in with the participants and convey the message about just how essential real community participation is for the nomination process, as with all safeguarding measures.

Session 13: Participants formed the same groups to prepare hypothetical nomination file on the elements that they chose at the Session 10 for the USL (form-01).

DAY 4

Session 13 continued throughout the morning.

Session 14: The participants presented their hypothetical USL nominations for the elements that had been chosen for the exercise on describing an element, in session 10 (Gazir Gaan, lost wax method, the festivals of offerings of Shaon: Shaone Dala and Jamail Mela). Each of the four groups prepared PPT formats which were well-structured, illustrating the interest in this exercise.

The facilitators provided critiques and comments on each mock nomination. These included the following in relation to nomination file criteria.

- Section C and D of the form: One group (group 3) misunderstood the requested questions for these sections. Instead of defining the communities and geographical location, the group described the element. The facilitators reminded the group of the importance of giving the right information in the right section of the form.
- Section 1: All groups described historical background and technical details in length, without mentioning the social function of the element in its contemporary community-based context. All omitted to provide crucial information relating to the element's conformity with the definition of ICH ('that communities... recognize it as part of their cultural identity... transmitted from generation to generation...[providing] communities and groups involved with a sense of identity and continuity'). None considered incompatibility with existing international human rights instruments.
- Section 2: Each group managed to describe the current viability, but failed to adequately identify clearly the threats element.
- Section 3: All groups proposed concrete and constructive safeguarding plans, but none managed to follow the UNESCO format of the safeguarding plan except for the group 1.

- Section 4: For Group 2, the community's roles seem to be reduced to those of informant. Group 3 failed to reply appropriately the questions asked. All groups had difficulties in understanding the meaning of the customary practices concerning the access to the ICH elements.
- Section 5: Group 2 made an appropriate description of the inventory to be made with community participation and updating.

Overall, despite the shortfalls in the mock nominations, the exercise – both preparing the nominations and the critiques from the facilitators – was instructive and received positive feedback from the participants, who felt that by the end of it, the criteria were far clearer.

Session 15: Updated consolidated Action Plan for the implementation of the ICH convention in Bangladesh

A draft Action plan for the implementation of the ICH Convention in Bangladesh to be recommended to the Minister of MOCA was prepared by UNESCO Dhaka Office and the facilitators taking into account the Action Plans endorsed by previous two workshops held within the framework of the 'UNESCO/Azerbaijan project for Safeguarding National Capacities for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage for Sustainable Development in Bangladesh.'

The draft Action Plan was to be presented to the participants at the final session of the workshop. However, due to the time constraints, it was distributed to the participants for their comments, proposed revisions and returning to the Dhaka UNESCO Office after the workshop. UNESCO Dhaka Office compiled the comments from the participants for the purposes of finalizing the Action Plan in consultation with the facilitators (Refer to Annex 3: The Draft Action Plan).

4. ASSESSMENT OF WORKSHOP AND PARTICIPANTS' LEARNING

4.1 Modules that were most interesting or challenging for participants

- The comparison of the two nominations on day 2 clearly motivated the participants to deepen their knowledge of the UNESCO ICH Convention in general, as well as their capacities to understand nomination requirements and notably the role of communities.
- The module on the drafting of a hypothetical nomination taking examples from ICH elements from Bangladesh (this module is not foreseen in UNESCO teaching material for the Nomination workshop), was both appealing and a challenge for the participants. Six out of 16 sessions of the workshop took the form of group works that was appreciated by the participants.
- The modules on community involvement in nominations also seemed to have been particularly interesting, most probably because it is highly visual and included the analysis of the shortfalls of the Falak singing file from Tajikistan, which was referred by 2017 IC. This file is largely original material prepared by the facilitator, with less theoretical and more practical examples of approaches to community involvement in nominations and the safeguarding of ICH in general.

4.2 Cases studies which worked well for the target audience

Case studies from foreign countries do not seem to draw much attention of the participants, unless they can draw clear parallels with their own situation.

However, two case studies showcasing the safeguarding measures clearly interested the participants - one involved safeguarding measures designed by the Government (Case Study 26, China) and the other measures initiated and implemented by a private initiative (Case Study 23, Estonia).

Participants also showed interest in the example of IPHAN, the Brazilian institution dealing with many levels of inventorying across the country, and the examples of inventories from India (Case Study on the Indira Gandhi Foundation inventory of ICH) and Australia (examples which are not taken from the CAP materials, but which the facilitator sourced).

The nomination file for 'Copper craftsmanship of Lahij', submitted by Azerbaijan for the Representative List and inscribed in 2015 was shown as an example of a good nomination, and incited a good deal of interest and discussion from the group, due to its resonance with metal smithing traditions in Bangladesh.

4.3. Key issues and questions raised by participants during the workshop

- The need to strengthen the initiatives taken and coordinating role of MOCA.
- Which institution should establish a national inventory of ICH, and what preparation is needed? What could the timeframe?
- How MOCA should identify elements of ICH to be nominated? How should the existing ICH Committee assist with procedures?
- Which institution/s under MOCA should become the leading institution for the preparation of the nomination?
- Who should ensure the community participation in the process of the nomination?
- How to ensure the community participation in the process of the nomination?
- Issues relating to sustainable development and ICH, notably in the Sundarbans area (in case of the Gazir Gan element, for example).
- Human rights and gender appropriateness and ICH safeguarding.
- Possibilities for multinational nominations: this question arose in relation to concerns regarding cross-border traditions which is understandable in light of the creation of West Pakistan and then Bangladesh being relatively recent history, and the many Bengali traditions shared by Bengali communities in both India and Bangladesh.

4.4. Estimated impact of this training on the safeguarding of ICH in the country

The fact that ten participants out of 34 were high officials of MOCA indicated a strong level of motivation to support and understand the Convention from the higher management, and did give an impetus to the workshop. Despite the fact that there were confrontations in discussions between officials and representatives of civil societies, these confrontations served as stimulus to all participants, both in terms of raising necessary discussions about the need for stronger support and initiatives from government in implementing the Convention, and in terms of deepen their knowledge about the Convention. Working in groups to evaluate the mock nomination and drafting a mock nomination of real ICH elements enabled participants to become more familiar with the mechanisms and criteria of nominations. If some of the participants could participate in the elaboration of future nomination from Bangladesh, we could estimate that the impact of this training has been effective.

Just what the impact of the training is or will be on safeguarding ICH in Bangladesh is hard to estimate, and will depend on the will of the Government and civil society, and their ability to join efforts for sustainable safeguarding measures. The workshop on safeguarding to be held in September 2018 will contribute further to efforts in this direction.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS: INCLUDING ORGANIZATION OF FUTURE WORKSHOPS (LOGISTICS, CONTENT, PARTICIPATION), IMPROVEMENT OF THE GENERIC TOOLKITS AND OTHER ISSUES

The recommendations arising from the three workshops to date, as taken from the discussions with participants and the facilitators observations - are included in the draft action plan annexed to this report.

Other recommendations relating to the upcoming workshop on safeguarding and logistics:

5.1 To structure the forth workshop on the safeguarding of ICH (slated for 16 to 19 September 2018) so that it includes well-structured and pragmatic group exercises on drafting safeguarding plans before starting role play.

5.2 To limited the number of participants and the greatest continuity possible through the inclusion of the stronger and more engaged participants from prior workshops.

5.3 Identify and invite representatives of other NGOs with sound project implementation experience (preferably in culture but also in related domains falling within the scope of sustainable development, such as environmental protection and in domains relating to ICH and migration – if not too sensitive for the national authorities this could address not only Bangladeshi migration but displaced persons), to increase the involvement of the civil sector, to encourage cross-sector collaboration in favour of ICH and to avoid concentrating knowledge of the Convention among a limited number of NGO representatives.

5.4 Request that participants come prepared for the workshop, having read key documents from the safeguarding materials (to be selected by the facilitators) and responded to a questionnaire on the basics of safeguarding in advance as a prerequisite of attending (the facilitators will prepare the questionnaire, which would be straightforward and aimed to stimulate their thinking about safeguarding prior to attending).

5.5 Arrange, if possible, a briefing on the workshop with the Ministry of Culture.

5.6 If possible, with the security restrictions, arrange a break in the schedule to enable a visit to one of the organizations (NGO or other) in Bangladesh dealing with safeguarding of ICH. This could, for example, involve visiting communities in the Sylhet District (the schedule permitting: an additional day may need to be foreseen for travel, if this is the case) that were involved in the pilot project exploring inventorying approaches and methodologies, carried out in the framework of the UNESCO/Azerbaijan Funds-in-Trust project.

The nomination forms:

5.7 We also recommend that the instruction of the Section 1 paragraph (i) of the nomination forms ICH-01, ICH-02 and ICH-03 be modified so that it begins with the sentence currently placed in the second paragraph: ‘The Committee should receive sufficient information to determine: a – e’, and place the first paragraph: ‘The section should address ...’ in the second paragraph, to encourage States Parties **not to omit** the description on how the chosen element is in conformity with the definition of the ICH given in the Article 2 of the Convention.

End of the report.

ANNEXES: These documents have been sent by WeTransfer to the UNESCO Dhaka Office

- 6.1. Programme indicating the sessions facilitated by each co-facilitator
- 6.2 The List of Participants
- 6.3 The draft Action Plan
- 6.4. PowerPoint presentations used during the workshop and audio-visual materials taken during the workshop (photos, videos, etc.): Please note that the videos taken from the UNESCO Website as case studies by Suzanne Ogge as referenced in the report as they are easily accessed on the UNESO ICH Webpage for listings.