**CONVENTION FOR THE SAFEGUARDING OF THE
INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE**

**Expert meeting on economic dimensions of**

**intangible cultural heritage safeguarding**

**27 – 28 September 2023 (Part I)**

**UNESCO Headquarters, Paris**

**20 October 2023 (Part II)**

**Online**

**Case studies**

# List of case studies[[1]](#footnote-1)

1. [Assisting communities to benefit from heritage innovations: gourmet bush food products based on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander traditions (Australia) 3](#_Toc145503435)
2. [Mundo Espiral Foundation and Artesanías de Colombia supporting the safeguarding of the element Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa of Putumayo and Nariño (Colombia) 6](#_Toc145503437)
3. [Art Jameel: a NGO training and supporting artist entrepreneurs (Egypt, Saudi Arabia) 8](#_Toc145503439)
4. [Georgian Heritage Crafts Association: a collective organization supporting craft practitioners (Georgia) 10](#_Toc145503441)
5. [South-south and private sector cooperation supporting basket weavers in the Bolgatanga region (Ghana) 12](#_Toc145503443)
6. [Heritage-sensitive intellectual property and marketing strategies for Chau Dance and Mask making (India) 14](#_Toc145503445)
7. [Community organizations safeguarding the Ritual Ceremony of the Voladores by supporting livelihoods and addressing misappropriation (Mexico) 16](#_Toc145503447)
8. [A community organization, state agencies and intellectual property protection supporting Slovenian beekeepers (Slovenia) 19](#_Toc145503449)
9. [!Khwa ttu: San culture and education centre creating employment opportunities while revitalizing and safeguarding heritage (South Africa) 21](#_Toc145503451)
10. [One Master, Thousand Masters (Bir Usta Bin Usta) project (Türkiye) 23](#_Toc145503453)
11. [Multiple economic factors affecting safeguarding: henna cultivation, cultural practices and body painting (Yemen) 24](#_Toc145503455)
12. [Community strategies relating to economic aspects of ICH in Sápmi 27](#_Toc145503457)

# Assisting communities to benefit from heritage innovations: gourmet bush food products based on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander traditions (Australia)[[2]](#footnote-2)

A ‘system mapping’ planning approach provides an interesting example of multifaceted community strategies for commercialization of their ICH (Indigenous knowledge) in Australia. This approach was developed by a team of academics working with a community of Indigenous peoples to help them develop commercialization strategies for gourmet bush food products such as sauces, jams, pies, and chutneys. The aim was to propose strategies to address challenges the community faced, in a context of historical disadvantage, and to protect their rights and interests in the market, while supporting control over their knowledge base.

Australia’s Indigenous people comprise Aboriginal people from mainland Australia and Torres Strait Islander people from the islands to the north of the mainland. While Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander groups share many cultural practices, they speak diverse languages, have different customary laws, and also have diverse needs and aspirations due to their diverse cultural and socio-economic backgrounds. The livelihoods, health and cultural practices of all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders were adversely affected by the colonization of Australia, however. For example, they lost the capacity to access land to maintain their cultural heritage or to participate in government decision-making about their territory, some of which led to environmental destruction. In spite of this, Indigenous communities manage to retain a strong connection between ‘Country’ and culture, or their tangible and intangible heritage, today. As Ngunnawal Elder Tina Brown, has stated:

*Indigenous communities keep their cultural heritage alive by passing their knowledge, arts, ceremonies and performances from one generation to another, speaking and teaching languages, protecting cultural materials, sacred and significant sites, and objects. For Indigenous Australians, the land is the core of all spirituality and this relationship and the spirit of “Country” is central to the issues that are important to Indigenous people today.[[3]](#footnote-3)*

‘Country’ is host to numerous species of plants that the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders have studied, used for food and medicine, and managed over millennia. For Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders, their heritage is not merely something ancient, but “includes items which may be created in the future.”[[4]](#footnote-4) Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander knowledge has contributed to the commercial development of ‘bush food’ species such as macadamia, lemon myrtle, wattle seeds, bush tomatoes, Kakadu plums, muntries, and Quandong. The profits from commercial businesses in these sectors have been large and are growing, with increased interest in new bush food varieties in recent years. However, there was no systematic support for community interests in bush food commercialization, so Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders were forced to rely on the goodwill of governments and developers to benefit from this process.

In the project described by Lingard and Martin (2016), academics consulted with community members to identify interests and problems. Community members interviewed for the study wanted to have better control over the use of plants and knowledge in accordance with customary law, to share fairly in the benefits, develop their own enterprises and partnerships, and ensure the transfer and maintenance of their knowledge in cultural practices (i.e. safeguarding their Indigenous knowledge).

The project team then reviewed the literature to identify different kinds of measures that could help to address these interests or problems as part of a comprehensive commercialization strategy. Possible strategies identified in the literature included knowledge databases, access protocols and contract law to help Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders preserve and exploit their knowledge; commercial partnerships, confidentiality agreements and trademarks to increase community business control in the market; and various educational, telecommunication, and regulatory measures to support landowners to develop wild harvest enterprises and help community members participate in bush food development. The project team also reviewed international legal frameworks to protect Indigenous knowledge holders, where they noted the absence of specific statutory protection for Indigenous knowledge and the importance of Access and Benefit Sharing approaches, alongside other mechanisms.

The planning approach outlined in Lingard and Martin (2016) drew on systems mapping models used by environmental law researchers to understand complex policy problems and to identify workable interventions in areas such as sustainable consumption. Systems mapping involves “visually mapping the system of interest” and identifying parts to change. The approach proposed the following steps:

1. identify the commercialization stages and actions;
2. identify the legal arrangements influencing each action;
3. assess the capacity of each arrangement to support community interests; and
4. identify the possible strategies to improve support for these interests.

Different stages of commercialization (e.g. sourcing of raw ingredients, product development, marketing, distribution and sales) were linked to different kinds of legal frameworks that could be used (such as regulations governing wild harvesting, contract law or trademark law). The systems mapping approach allowed the project team to examine gaps in existing regulatory frameworks. For example, although Australian laws required people to obtain a license to grow and sell native plants, they did not require licensees or licensors to consider Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander interests in doing so. There were also practical barriers faced by some Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people who had limited access to buyers, online markets, technology, information, and business expertise.

Different strategies were identified in each of the stages of commercialization, to be considered by community members and regulators. Some strategies involved supporting the community in developing contracts with third party businesses or providing additional government support to help them set up their own (such as education, the creation of a dedicated business unit or reducing fees for export or trademark registration). Others involved encouraging or requiring third party suppliers and distributors to support the community in an ethical and socially responsible way (for example through royalty payments, or consent requirements for business registration). The project recommended better legal protections, for example by recognizing the rights of traditional custodians to exploit their undeveloped species, prohibiting unauthorized use of knowledge published by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders, and prohibiting the unauthorized use of cultural words and symbols. Tools such as a traditional custodian register of areas linked to the natural locations of plant species and a database of Indigenous cultural claims and cultural restrictions on knowledge sharing were proposed to help manage information, consents and royalties for community benefit.

The approach recognized that as entrepreneurs, individual Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander knowledge holders might sometimes have different interests from the community as a whole, and some strategies were needed to regulate individual entrepreneurial behaviour to protect collective resources, such as the Indigenous knowledge on which the products were based. For example, some Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people might develop products from secret foods, which risks revealing the secret to others because product labels have to contain ingredient information. Several strategies were proposed to address this. First, traditional custodians could be given the sole right to exploit undeveloped species. Second, by linking ethical guidelines to the grant of business licenses, communities could control what products were allowed to be commercialized.

This work informed the drafting of several policy briefings suggesting changes in the regulatory or governance environment to help Indigenous bushfoods businesses to thrive while protecting the underlying Indigenous knowledge (Lingard 2015a and b). Anika Valenti and Terri Janke and Company, an Indigenous law firm, worked with the Department of Primary Industries and Regional Development (DPIRD) in Australia to develop sector-specific guidance for Indigenous peoples on setting up bushfoods businesses.[[5]](#footnote-5) Through a Seed Science Forum at the Botanic Gardens, Terri Janke (author of True Tracks, 2019)[[6]](#footnote-6) and other Indigenous speakers educated scientists about the challenges posed by open access to Indigenous knowledge. The Australian government is now exploring changes in the policy environment to support Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples to protect and commercialize their Indigenous Knowledge.[[7]](#footnote-7)

Further information

* Lingard, Kylie, & Martin, P. 2016. Strategies to Support the Interests of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Peoples in the Commercial Development of Gourmet Bush Food Products. *International Journal of Cultural Property,* *23*(1), 33-70. doi:[10.1017/S0940739116000023](https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/international-journal-of-cultural-property/article/strategies-to-support-the-interests-of-aboriginal-and-torres-strait-islander-peoples-in-the-commercial-development-of-gourmet-bush-food-products/63BA8FEE23CC019FB3B163CBAF278D14)
* Lingard, Kylie, Stoianoff, N., Wright, E., & Wright, S. 2021. Are we there yet? A review of proposed Aboriginal cultural heritage laws in New South Wales, Australia. *International Journal of Cultural Property,* *28*(1), 107-135. doi:[10.1017/S0940739120000284](https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/international-journal-of-cultural-property/article/abs/are-we-there-yet-a-review-of-proposed-aboriginal-cultural-heritage-laws-in-new-south-wales-australia/2BD57AAC4B35377A2BE73D273C320E7B)
* Lingard, Kylie 2015a. ‘The Potential of Law to Support Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Interests in Bush Food Commercialisation’. NintiOne Policy briefing. <https://www.nintione.com.au/resource/PB005_PolicyBriefing_PotentialOfLawSupportAboriginalTorresStraitIslanderInterestsBushFoodCommercialisation.pdf>
* Lingard, Kylie 2015b. ‘An inclusive governance framework for bush food commercialisation’. NintiOne Policy briefing. <http://www.nintione.com.au/resource/PB008_PolicyBriefing_InclusiveGovernanceFrameworkBushfoodCommercialisation.pdf>
* Terri Janke and Company website, Setting up for success: bushfoods <https://www.terrijanke.com.au/setting-up-for-success-bushfoods>

Mundo Espiral Foundation and Artesanías de Colombia supporting the safeguarding of the element Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa of Putumayo and Nariño (Colombia)[[8]](#footnote-8)

Communities facing ICH safeguarding challenges linked to under-remuneration have benefited from safeguarding planning that takes the role of the market into account in developing a common strategy for practitioners’ businesses as well as their heritage practice. Government agencies and NGOs can assist communities in such circumstances by, for example, providing access to capacity building and marketing platforms.

Traditional knowledge and techniques associated with Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa of Putumayo and Nariño (Colombia) was inscribed on the Urgent Safeguarding List in 2020.[[9]](#footnote-9) The production chain for this woodenware tradition starts in Mocoa with the collection of the fruits or buds of the mopa-mopa bush, continues in Nariño with the production of the woodenware and ends up with the decoration of woodenware in Pasto, applying the mopa-mopa resin. Practitioners and bearers of the element include mopa-mopa fruit harvesters, woodmasters or wood craftsmen, making furniture or sculpture; and varnish masters who transform the mopa-mopa fruit into thin-coloured sheets used to decorate woodenware. The techniques associated with mopa-mopa harvesting, wood treatment and varnish decoration are a source of identity for the communities of the Amazon and the Andes, strengthening family ties that span generational and territorial differences.

The Committee decision on the nomination file noted the link between insufficient remuneration of bearers and the lack of transmission of the know-how, leading to its endangered status.[[10]](#footnote-10) Local practitioners of Pasto Varnish can be self-employed, linked by guilds and family-owned trade structures. However, the mopa-mopa bush is becoming more rare, collection sites are considered dangerous and practitioners are few in number, and do not pass on their knowledge in a systematic way. Practitioners do not enjoy a high social status as harvesters or artisans, and the woodenware objects are undervalued and poorly marketed, so they do not earn proper remuneration for their work. Each one lowers prices to the minimum in order to sell, which generates competition within the craftsmen's guild. In the decades before inscription, the number of practitioners had rapidly decreased and many have sought employment elsewhere.

Various efforts had been made to support the practitioners of the tradition before its inscription, including research and a Designation of Origin (geographical indication) registration for “Mopa-Mopa Pasto Varnish” in 2011. One of the organizations assisting the community in safeguarding the element since 2012 was the [Mundo Espiral Foundation](http://fundacionmundoespiral.blogspot.com/p/quienes-somos.html), an NGO [accredited](https://ich.unesco.org/doc/src/52877-EN.pdf) under the 2003 Convention. The Foundation has been helping communities with the safeguarding of their cultural heritage in southern Colombia, including the preparation of inventory entries, nomination files and Special Safeguarding Plans. The Foundation worked with the practitioners’ organization “Pasto Varnish Cultural Foundation” and various government agencies in developing the first Special Safeguarding Plan for Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa (2019-2023).

The Special Safeguarding Plan included a number of safeguarding measures aimed at ensuring access to the raw materials and their environmental sustainability, supporting stronger community organization and participation, documenting the bearers’ varnish and craft techniques, improving workshop conditions and transmission of knowledge and skills, raising awareness through events, exhibitions and fairs, holding price setting meetings among bearers, developing a sustainable tourism plan and improving cultural entrepreneurship and marketing.

To implement the safeguarding plan, alliances were established with various organizations including [Artesanías de Colombia](https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/PortalAC/General/template_index.jsf) (Crafts of Colombia) and the Mundo Espiral Foundation. Artesanias de Colombia is a Colombian organization funded by government that assists communities to share skills for making marketable products based on their ICH, market the products on a common digital platform, and protect their businesses using intellectual property law.[[11]](#footnote-11) Their travel guides incorporate traditional craft routes.[[12]](#footnote-12) They also help artists enforce infringements of their rights through court actions. Artesanías de Colombia supported capacity building and market support for mopa mopa Pasto Varnish. The organization provided business training, hosted [competitions](https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/PortalAC/C_ferias/gran-final-copa-artesanal-contando-el-cuento_15497) and [events](https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/PortalAC/feriasSubMenu/eventos-de-promocion_3282) and created [marketing platforms](https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/document/documentos/CATALOGO%20ETNICO%20Y%20TRADICIONAL.pdf) for the community. These efforts have helped to raise the status of practitioners as artists of a heritage craft, and to ensure they had the skills and infrastructure to earn a decent living from their craft, based on the sustainable harvesting of the plant. More young people are now interested in learning the craft. In the second phase of the safeguarding plan from 2023, the local administration has partnered with design students from the University of Nariño to create new [facades](https://www.pasto.gov.co/index.php/noticias-cultura/15495-avanza-segunda-fase-del-plan-especial-de-salvaguarda-del-barniz-de-pasto-mopa-mopa) for the workshops to attract visitors.

For its part, the Mundo Espiral Foundation has helped to implement a [safeguarding project](https://ich.unesco.org/en/assistances/between-the-amazon-and-the-andes-safeguarding-and-transmission-of-the-traditional-knowledge-and-techniques-associated-with-pasto-varnish-mopa-mopa-of-the-putumayo-and-nario-departments-of-colombia-01926) supported by the Ministry of Culture and the UNESCO ICH Fund. This project was entitled "Between the Amazon and the Andes: safeguarding and transmission of traditional knowledge and techniques associated with Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa of Putumayo and Nariño, departments of Colombia" (2022-2024). The main objective of this project is to promote safeguarding, specifically by helping practitioners to train more apprentices. The project comprises four main activities: (a) capacity building of fifty-five practitioners distributed among the different areas of practice (harvesting the plant, carpentry, carving, turning and varnishing); (b) a pilot apprenticeship programme in which each practitioner will work alongside an apprentice in a one-to-one learning environment; (c) documentation of the life and work of the Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa practitioners to understand their specific needs and contexts; and (d) raising awareness about the practice among local youth, the communities of Nariño and Putumayo and key stakeholders, such as the private sector, local public entities and local non-governmental organizations.

This safeguarding work will not just inspire more apprentices to learn the practice, it will improve cooperation between mopa-mopa harvesters and artisans of the Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa, and enable stronger marketing so that practitioners can be fairly remunerated. Through such work, safeguarding of Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa is understood an integral process of both stimulating participation in and respect for the heritage itself, and supporting businesses that are based on it to prosper in an economically and environmentally sustainable way.

Further information

* Artesanías de Colombia <https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/PortalAC/General/template_index.jsf>
* Mundo Espiral Foundation <http://fundacionmundoespiral.blogspot.com/p/quienes-somos.html>
* Barniz de Pasto Mopa–Mopa <https://barnizpasto.wixsite.com/mopamopa>
* PES - Barniz de Pasto Mopa–Mopa 2015 <https://youtu.be/ko7M8w3WJ8k>

Art Jameel: a NGO training and supporting artist entrepreneurs
(Egypt, Saudi Arabia)

NGOs can play an important role in supporting artist entrepreneurs in a way that can contribute to safeguarding the underlying ICH.

Art Jameel is a non-governmental organisation that fosters and promotes contemporary art, cultural heritage protection, and creative entrepreneurship across the Middle East, North Africa, Turkey and beyond. Art Jameel has opened several training centres, including the Jameel House of Traditional Arts in Cairo (established 2008),[[13]](#footnote-13) the Jameel House of Traditional Arts in Jeddah (established 2015),[[14]](#footnote-14) and is supporting the establishment of the Jameel House of Traditional Arts in Scotland on the estate of Dumfries House. The organization aims to safeguard traditional arts and crafts by supporting artisan education and assisting graduates to apply those skills to heritage restoration or as entrepreneurs.[[15]](#footnote-15) Art Jameel sees cultural heritage preservation and safeguarding of heritage – whether monuments, antiquities, or traditional crafts – as key to unlocking the creative potential of the future and, alongside support for creative industries, to helping local communities sustain livelihoods and cultural expression.[[16]](#footnote-16)

Every year, about 20 young Egyptians graduate from the Jameel House of Traditional Arts in Cairo, with a two-year diploma in traditional Islamic arts, including geometry, drawing, colour harmony and arabesque studies, as well as specialised training in ceramics, glass and gypsum, metalwork and woodwork. The students undertake field projects at major monuments and practical design-and-make projects. Art Jameel supports graduates from the diploma programme to seek employment or to establish businesses in the traditional arts. One of the ways it does this is through an initiative called Atelier Cairo Art Jameel, a coworking space for craft entrepreneurs, a gallery and shop for craft design, and a venue for public workshops in the traditional arts. Atelier Cairo Art Jameel offers entrepreneurship programmes tailored to the specific needs of craft designers, including a learning programme for starting or expanding a craft business, an access to finance programme, and an access to market programme.[[17]](#footnote-17)

The Jameel House of Traditional Arts in Jeddah is a centre for artisanship, architecture and heritage preservation. Its one-year programme focuses on Islamic geometry, patterns and design, nabati ornaments, colour harmony and decorative techniques, woodwork, gypsum-carving and other traditional crafts within the rich architectural heritage of the Old Town. The programme was expanded in 2019 to include product design. The addition of the new module aimed to help artisans in Saudi Arabia achieve a sustainable livelihood in the practice of their craft, through the design of products for the market. Participants are taught by local artists and designers, and visiting tutors from abroad, facilitated by the Prince’s Foundation School of Traditional Arts in the UK. The new module aimed to help participants translate their craft skills into restoration work as well as product design, both key routes to sustainable employment as craftspeople.[[18]](#footnote-18) Also in Jeddah, Art Jameel’s community-focussed Hayy Learning education platform offers in-person and virtual learning, research and apprenticeships.

The organization has also supported artists directly in times of need. In response to the challenges arising from the COVID-19 pandemic and its effects on the arts and creative sector, in 2020 Art Jameel introduced a research and practice platform for independent practitioners.[[19]](#footnote-19) The programme was intended primarily for those who work on a per-project basis and whose practices were affected by programme cancellations and project changes, locally or globally. The programme was open to all practitioners based in the Middle East and North Africa region.[[20]](#footnote-20)

Further information

* Art Jameel website <https://artjameel.org/>

Georgian Heritage Crafts Association: a collective organization supporting craft practitioners (Georgia)[[21]](#footnote-21)

Collective organizations can assist practitioners to maximize benefits from market engagement, and raise awareness about the value of their heritage. The Georgian Heritage Crafts Association ([GHCA](https://crafts.ge/)) was established as a collective organization in 2015 to assist practitioners of heritage crafts to safeguard their heritage and support their livelihoods. The largest membership-based organization in the crafts sector in Georgia, the GHCA has 300 members. It has created a networking platform for individuals, craftspeople, organizations and guilds, mobilizing and supporting craft practitioners at the grassroots level and leading advocacy campaigns with state bodies to pursue needs-based strategies benefiting practitioners.

Craft practitioners in Georgia have a long history of developing and transmitting their skills, but face many current challenges. Georgia’s vibrant and diverse craft traditions in ceramic, woodcarving, stonework, metalwork, leatherwork, basket weaving and textiles have been shaped by centuries of trade crossing east and west. Over the last two centuries, artisanal guilds actively supplied the growing demand in the local market for tableware, rugs and so on. During the period of Soviet control (1921-1991), some of these crafts were subsidized by the State and became industrialized. After the collapse of the Soviet system, practitioners in these craft sectors lost their subsidies and suffered from limited self-employment potential, weak business skills, and practically no access to new markets. These challenges inspired the formation of the GHCA. Since its establishment, the GHCA has engaged in various activities to support heritage crafts and practitioners in Georgia, including:

* **Undertaking research, inventorying and documentation** identifying endangered heritage crafts for revitalization and assessing the needs of practitioners;
* **Creating new opportunities for transmission of craft-related skills** by craft practitioners through formal and non-formal education;
* **Providing capacity building and marketing support** enhancing the Georgian heritage craft sector’s economic potential and competitiveness, and supporting practitioner livelihoods; and
* **Organizing publications, awards, festivals and events** raising public awareness about, and appreciation of, Georgian heritage crafts nationally and internationally.

The GHCA has engaged in inventorying and documentation of heritage crafts, surveying nearly 1000 practitioners in Georgia. This has provided information about endangered heritage crafts, practitioners, transmission patterns and the social and economic challenges faced by practitioners to inform its activities supporting the sector. In 2020-2021, for example, GHCA implemented a pilot project ‘[Community-based inventorying of intangible cultural heritage, related to traditional income-generating activities in Old Tbilisi](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ARmrSeq1sj8&list=PLNEyomugFhWMR1clN9vuKJHq9EcqTsKW8&index=21)’ as part of the UNESCO project ‘Intangible cultural heritage and creativity for sustainable cities”. Project activities included meetings with local community members, and capacity-building on community-based inventorying. As a result, 25 local young facilitators and cultural workers in Tbilisi acquired skills and hands-on experience working with communities on audio-visual documentation of ICH. As a result of this project, GHCA produced and released 20 video stories and launched [Tbilisi ICH Week 4-11 July, 2021](https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLNEyomugFhWMR1clN9vuKJHq9EcqTsKW8), reaching nearly 60,000 people on social media during the festival month.

Based on the needs of practitioners identified by the above research, the GHCA launched a Special Training and Educational program. This had two main aspects to it. First, donor funds were raised from various sources to renovate and equip 40 workshops across the country for hands-on training and passing of traditional skills to younger generations, with a special focus on rural areas and endangered crafts. These centers continue to function as educational hubs for more than 200 young apprentices across the country. Experienced practitioner have also been encouraged to engage more actively with the formal education system through a memorandum of understanding with the newly established [Vocational Skills Agency](https://www.linkedin.com/company/skills-agency-georgia) and other relevant stakeholders. The aim is to create a new institutional entity to enable better integration of craft stakeholders, teachers and pivate companies in the education system.

Second, the GHCA provided business skills training and support to ensure that practitioners could earn a decent livelihood from selling their products. Training was provided to over 300 practitioner across Georgia in product development, branding and packaging of products, digital marketing, export regulations, and visitor experience development. The GHCA assisted practitioners to apply traditional skills and techniques to new products. The organization developed new marketplaces for selling traditional crafts, including thematic fairs (Annual Christmas, Women’s days and Easter [Fairs](https://crafts.ge/?p=exhibitionSale) and Festivals) and a GHCA shop [“EthnoDesign”](https://www.crafts.ge/?p=store). This shop has managed to raise approximately 1 million USD through direct sales between 2016 and 2021. With the help of the WIPO Traditional Knowledge Division, the GHCA is currently working to use intellectual property tools such as trademarks and geographical indications for different craft-related products. With the support of Centre for Strategic Research and Development of Georgia, the GHCA recently launched a new project “Pop-up Ethnodesign”, to create a ‘shop on wheels’, which will travel to different places in the country.

In order to raise the profile of heritage crafts and to promote its practitioners locally, the GHCA launched a special award in 2015 called “Craftsman of the Year”, recognizing master practitioners engaged in transmission, and some of the best young apprentices. It has also raised awareness through [publications](https://crafts.ge/?p=library) such as craft workshop guidebooks, articles, books and reports. International exposure for Georgian crafts and their practitioners is also very important for awareness raising and market development. In 2018-2019 the GHCA launched the [International Festival of Traditional Crafts Workshops](https://www.facebook.com/craftsworkshopfestival), held at Akhaltsikhe Castle (Rabati) in partnership with the Georgian State Museum of Folk and Applied Arts, supported by Georgian Ministry of Education, Science, Culture, and Sports and USAID. The festival brought together craft practitioners from all over Georgia and internationally (150 participants in all). It included demonstration master-classes for crafts such as ceramics, woodcarving, carpet/rug weaving, use of natural dyes, felt and jewellery making. The festival aimed to raise public awareness of master practitioners and diverse local crafts, and also to enhance the integration of artisan workshops in local tourist routes. As a response to the COVID-19 pandemic, in 2020-2021 the festival went online, with 22 video masterclasses documenting and demonstration making processes and bearers’ stories. On social media, engagement during the festival week extended to nearly 53,000 interactions. Some of the videos have been shared on the [Create Day](https://createday.org/) platform (2020- 2021), a global initiative launched by London Craft Week. With assistance from the Michelangelo Foundation, the GHCA was able to assist master practitioners to attend the [Homo Faber Event 2022 in Venice](https://www.homofaber.com/en/event) and their inclusion on the [Homo Faber Guide](https://www.homofaber.com/en/guide), an online platform promoting the best of European Craftsmanship. In 2022 GHCA joined the [European Artistic Crafts Days](http://eacdays.eu/%22%20%5Ct%20%22new) (Journées Européennes des Métiers d’Art, JEMA / EACD) another initiative to promote Georgian makers internationally.

Further information:

* GHCA website <https://crafts.ge/>

South-south and private sector cooperation supporting basket weavers in the Bolgatanga region (Ghana)[[22]](#footnote-22)

South-south partnerships and private sector support can assist practitioners to innovate in heritage-sensitive ways and develop fair trade practices to address challenges in their local markets that affect the practice and transmission of ICH.

Bolgatanga (or Bolga) is a town in the Upper East Region of Ghana, near the border with Burkina Faso. Located at the convergence of ancient trade routes across the Sahara and Sahel, the town has long been famous for its crafts, including leather goods, smocks, Bolga hats and straw baskets. Today, thousands of baskets are traded through the central Bolgatanga basket market every market day or exported directly from producers. Ensuring decent work and fair remuneration for Bolga baskets, based on heritage-appropriate market innovations, has helped Gurunsi weavers in Ghana to practice, transmit and therefore safeguard their basket-making skills.

The most widely produced basket, colloquially known as a market basket, was in the past generally hand woven from a local grass by Gurunsi men, who wove sieves for millet alcohol, hats, mats and storage containers in breaks from their farming activities. Traditional weaving skills have been passed down from generation to generation, and from men to women, in the area around the town. Today, basket weavers (many of whom are women) use ‘elephant grass’ (veta vera) instead of local grass, harvested in the forests around Kumasi, around 500km south of Bolgatanga. A 16-inch round market basket contains around 25,000 'knots' at the interface between warp and weft straws. Such a basket takes several days to weave, not including preparing and dyeing the straw. Baskets are today generally coloured with synthetic instead of plant-based dyes, although there is a trend back to plant dyes. Market baskets are not widely used by local people today because of their export value, but weaving techniques are still used to make other items such as hats that are used in the community.

Sales of baskets and other woven products support livelihoods in the community: women have come to rely on these skills to provide food for the family. However, weavers faced challenges in this market from the early 2000s. Imported cut-price copies from Asia, made out of sea grass with vinyl-covered handles, flooded the market at a time when local basket quality had declined, prices barely covered production costs, and customer service was poor. Together, these factors threatened the reputation and the future of Bolga basket weaving, but they also encouraged local businesses to innovate with new colours and designs.

The weavers of Bolgatanga formed a [Bolgatanga Basket Weavers' Cooperative](https://www.modernghana.com/news/270861/1/basket-weavers-create-employment-in-upper-east.html) around 2006-2011, but found it difficult to address structural problems in the market. From 2013-2014, a group of Bolgatanga weavers worked with India’s [National Institute of Design](https://nid.org.in/) (NID) and various NGOs to identify appropriate innovations in dyeing methods, improve the quality of products (especially hats) and to deploy traditional techniques in new basket products. A selected number of weavers attended workshops in India, and a follow-up workshop was held in Accra. The NID provided technical support to help weavers identify a new dyeing process for the grasses. The new dyes incorporated materials, such as locally-made soap and vinegar, that could be sustainably accessed and used in the weavers’ village environment. A new basket shape was invented, the [Pakurigo Wave](https://www.holeandcorner.com/interviews/in-the-studio-with-mary-anaba-master-weaver-baba-tree-basket-company), a collaboration between a designer from India (Mr Palash Singh) and a master weaver from Ghana (Mr John Akurigo), combining traditional materials and methods with new techniques. After the workshop, weavers working for [The Baba Tree](https://babatree.com/) company, with its director Gregory MacCarthy, perfected the techniques developed for the Pakurigo Wave, and developed Art Basket designs. Jemima Akolgo was the first to weave a new type of basket invented during the India workshop, named ‘[Jemima 10 Cows](https://babatree.com/collections/jemima-10-cows)’ in her honour. Building on other local traditions, goat leather handles were used for the baskets.

The project resulted in increased creative confidence among weavers. Baba Tree weaver "Madame Thousand" came up with the "Woman and Man" design, which has further evolved over time. [Commenting](https://garlandmag.com/article/the-bolga-basket-from-ahmedabad-comes-to-accra/) on the more than 100 new pieces that were shown in Accra, master weaver Akabare Abentare said; “See how many products there are here! We want the others in Bolgatanga to see these and we will teach them how to make them. This is much more than the cheap copies of our baskets.” With the revitalization of the Bolga basket’s reputation and its earning potential, weavers have [doubled](https://garlandmag.com/article/the-bolga-basket-from-ahmedabad-comes-to-accra/) their daily rate between 2013 and 2016.

Today, many weavers sell their baskets through retailers rather than directly in the market. Some basket retailers highlight their [fair trade](https://basketsofafrica.com/weaving-bolga-baskets-in-ghana/) credentials, but not all of them have chosen formal certification. The Baba Tree pays weavers both a commission when baskets are sold as well as an initial payment for a completed basket; support for school fees and medical expenses is also provided. Weavers are photographed with their baskets for the online catalogue, acknowledging their role as artists and artisans. Their approach includes enabling economies of scale (for example by providing dyed straw for weavers, saving them costs of dye, firewood and salt, or providing a specialist service to add leather handles), calibrating prices depending on difficulty, practising quality control and selling high quality baskets at an appropriate price so that they can reward weavers fairly.

Today, Bolgatanga basket weavers are addressing other challenges, including prohibitive transport and storage costs bringing the grass they use as a raw material to their location. The Ghana Export Promotion Authority plans to assist them not just to plant grass in the northern region of the country, but to create spaces and warehouses for weavers. Ghana has recognized the importance of the non-traditional export sector which contributes about 20% of the country’s export trade.

The design project in Ghana was part of an Indian government programme started in 2011 to provide assistance to African artisans under India’s Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion in the Ministry of Commerce and Industry, supported by the Ministry of External Affairs. Implementing this programme, the NID provided collaborative design assistance aiming to empower weavers in five countries in Africa: Ethiopia, Ghana, Malawi, Zimbabwe and Zambia. NID’s work with Bolga weavers in Ghana was undertaken in association with a South African-based NGO, The New Basket Workshop, acting as project consultant. The [G-lish Foundation](https://seed.uno/enterprise-profiles/g-lish-foundation), did a [study](https://cdn.shopify.com/s/files/1/0356/5021/files/Fair_Market_Report_G-lish_Foundation_07b24e30-a09d-46db-9faa-08c57cae20a0.pdf?1004) on remuneration in the basket industry and promoted the use of recycled materials in basket weaving. [Aid to Artisans Ghana (ATAG)](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qFvnKmcCE5M) assisted with the project.[[23]](#footnote-23) Basket retailers such as [Baba Tree](https://babatree.com/) and [Delata](https://www.delata-ghana.com/) were involved in the project.

Further information:

* Frances Potter, ‘The Bolga basket: Ahmedabad comes to Accra’ Garland Magazine 24 February 2016, <https://garlandmag.com/article/the-bolga-basket-from-ahmedabad-comes-to-accra/>
* G-lish Foundation, Fair Market Report on The Straw Basket Industry in Bolgatanga, 2014 <https://cdn.shopify.com/s/files/1/0356/5021/files/Fair_Market_Report_G-lish_Foundation_07b24e30-a09d-46db-9faa-08c57cae20a0.pdf?1004>
* CIBER Focus Interview with Bridget Kyerematen-Darko ‘Aid to Artisans Ghana’ [CIBER Focus: ‘Aid to Artisans Ghana’ with Bridget Kyerematen-Darko - YouTube](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qFvnKmcCE5M)
* Aisha Salaudeen, Rachel Wood and Sandy Thin, ‘How these Ghanaian women have made basket weaving into a million dollar industry’, CNN (26 April 2019) <https://edition.cnn.com/2019/04/25/africa/ghana-bolga-basket-weavers-intl/index.html>

Heritage-sensitive intellectual property and marketing strategies for Chau Dance and Mask making (India)[[24]](#footnote-24)

Development of community strategies for safeguarding can take market considerations into account, to ensure that livelihoods are supported and the rights of practitioners are protected.

Purulia Chau (or Chhau) is a dynamic acrobatic dance with elaborate masks performed for ritual purposes as well as to paying audiences for entertainment in West Bengal, India. The dance practice was inscribed, alongside two other Chau styles, on the UNESCO Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2010. Practitioners of the dance and artisans who make the masks want to earn a decent livelihood from practising their art, building a customer base willing to pay fair prices, but faced many challenges in the market context.

A local NGO, Banglanatak dot com had been working with the dance and mask-making communities for more than a decade, assisting them to access government artist grants, financial services and heritage skills training. However, they found that while individual artists were able to find customers and earn a living, they still often lacked sufficient negotiating power in interactions with festival organizers, mask buyers, film-makers and others. Dancers are sometimes contracted for a performance, but not paid. Safety requirements are not always respected even though dancers are doing more acrobatic stunts performances, and masks have become so large and ornate they may threaten artist safety. While they can recognize unethical behaviour, for example when dancers were not attributed in films featuring their performances, artists are also not always aware of their rights. Both dancers and mask-makers are increasingly engaging with customers online, but much of the information about their heritage available online has been created by third parties.

To help address these challenges, between 2018 and 2021, Banglanatak dot com, worked with community members and a multidisciplinary group of external experts on the [HIPAMS project](http://www.hipams.org) funded by a three-year British Academy grant. Heritage-sensitive intellectual property and marketing strategies (HIPAMS), were created to help the community minimize harms and maximize sustainable development and safeguarding benefits from market engagement. The HIPAMS project found that certain mitigations could help address the challenges identified. Community empowerment supporting collective action, rooted in ethical and rights-based approaches, helped practitioners develop a stronger negotiating position in the market. Heritage-sensitive marketing helped to strengthen and elevate the voice of practitioners as well as to communicate the meaning and value of the heritage more effectively. Capacity-building on intellectual property rights and ethics helped practitioners to understand their rights, protect their interests and bring customers and clients on board. Finally, community reflection on the ‘roots’ of a tradition (what they valued about their heritage and wanted to retain) and its relationship to products and services they were offering (the ‘fruits’ of the tradition) helped them respond more robustly to market pressures and develop more heritage-sensitive innovations in the marketplace.

While Purulia Chau dancers and mask-makers practise a common heritage, community organisations within these groups did not generally work together or have any common marketing strategies at the beginning of the HIPAMS project. The HIPAMS planning process identified some possible benefits from dancers and mask makers pursuing both individual and collective marketing approaches. Digital storytelling training helped the artists to improve their online visibility, content quality and the range of stories they told. They created more diverse stories, about dance troupe rehearsals and the ‘person behind the mask’, not just recordings of performances and mask-making processes. By the end of the project, more than half of the artists surveyed had YouTube channels, and used Facebook and WhatsApp to share their work. They agreed on common hashtags to link their efforts, and used a collective website[[25]](#footnote-25) and Facebook platform ‘Folk art of Purulia’.

Through capacity-building in intellectual property law, artists learned that they had the right to control copying of their work (copyrights) and insist on attribution for performances (performer’s rights). Knowledge about these rights helped artists negotiate better prices when customers wanted to use their work commercially, and to ensure that they were credited during collaborative projects. In many cases, artists wished to share information about their work, but to control how it was shared. Attendees at Chau festivals and the visitors of Charida village were encouraged to share information and photos of the event using a creative commons CC-BY-NC license. After the training, artists also understood the usefulness of written agreements (even if only on Whatsapp messages) that could help them hold clients to account. Understanding their rights gives artists power even if they cannot afford to enforce them in court, because rights can form the basis of ethical codes of conduct. Chau dancers and mask makers worked with the HIPAMS team to develop ethical codes explaining their rights and how they want their individual art and collective heritage to be treated by others. Referring to these codes as good practices helped artists in their negotiations with event organizers, galleries, film-makers and other stakeholders.

Individual and collective reflection on the relationship between the ‘roots’ and ‘fruits’ of Chau dance and mask making helped practitioners think about how market engagement supported or undermined the heritage repertoire of skills and knowledge they had created and depended on over time. Dancers raised concerns, for example, about the trend towards using narrators in live performances because it affected the flow of the performance. Previously this work had been done by specialised *Jhumur* singers and musicians, but these practitioners had become too expensive for promoters to hire for live events. To try and reduce the need for narrators and educate new audiences, the project created online narratives in Bengali and English, accessible by QR code on Chau performance flyers and posters. Reflecting on the ‘roots’ of the tradition inspired mask makers to do their own internet research on historical masks. This informed variations on techniques of decorating masks with natural materials instead of plastic and glass beads for eco-sensitive customers.

This project showed that market engagement, although not without its challenges, can encourage safeguarding and transmission to some extent by ensuring that practitioners benefit from their heritage practice and it remains meaningful to them. Mitigation of harms in the market context is possible, especially through collective action based on ethics or rights-based approaches. By the end of the project, while some challenges remained, all the Chau dancers surveyed said that their remuneration for each performance and the numbers of annual performances had increased, even during the COVID-19 pandemic. Chau mask makers were able to do more online marketing and started selling products after developing new contacts online, increasing their monthly earnings. They had a stronger voice in communicating the heritage value of both dances and masks in collective as well as individual marketing platforms, and were inspired to create further heritage-sensitive innovations in the Chau tradition.

Further information

* The HIPAMS project repository [www.hipams.org](http://www.hipams.org) and Banglanatak dot com [www.banglanatak.com](http://www.banglanatak.com)

Community organizations safeguarding the Ritual Ceremony of the Voladores by supporting livelihoods and addressing misappropriation (Mexico)[[26]](#footnote-26)

Community organizations can play a very important role in supporting businesses based on ICH, and in identifying ways to address challenges of over-tourism and misappropriation.

The Ritual ceremony of the Voladores (or ‘flying men’), [inscribed](https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/ritual-ceremony-of-the-voladores-00175) on the UNESCO Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2009, originated in pre-colonial times and was once practised by various Mesoamerican communities and groups over a wide area in Middle America. Today it is still practised by the Totonac in Veracruz and Puebla, the Teenek San Luis Potosí, the Nahuas in Puebla, the Ñañhus in Hidalgo, the Mezatecs in Michoacán all in Mexico. It is also practised by the Maya/Quiche in Guatemala. The Totonac community is very eager to safeguard the tradition and the requisite skills continue to be transmitted to Volador children through specialized schools. Associations of Voladores have been communicating with each other and with State officials to help safeguard the ceremony. In the Totonacapan region there are 33 groups of registered Voladores, three Schools for Volador Children, three Associations of Voladores and about 500 identified Voladores.

In preparation for the ceremony itself – if the full traditional ritual is performed – a tree is cut down, transported, ritually prepared and erected in a central area. Preparatory rituals, including offerings to Mother Earth, are performed and those who will participate in the ceremony undergo physical and spiritual preparation. During the ceremony, five men (Voladores) climb the pole, which is 18–38 m high. While one of them dances at the top, playing the flute and drum, the others swing from the pole on ropes, turning around the pole and mimicking flight. Although there are many variations to the ceremony, it was, and often still is, in essence, a ritual to establish communion with the gods and ensure the fertility of the earth. It is therefore held during various celebrations and festivities, such as patron saint festivities, carnivals, solstices and equinoxes, festivities surrounding the Day of the Dead and in ceremonies associated with the sowing and harvesting of crops.

Safeguarding work with Voladores at the [Center for Indigenous Arts](https://ich.unesco.org/en/BSP/xtaxkgakget-makgkaxtlawana-the-centre-for-indigenous-arts-and-its-contribution-to-safeguarding-the-intangible-cultural-heritage-of-the-totonac-people-of-veracruz-mexico-00666) of Papantla has provided more than 300 cultural jobs to bearers of the tradition. The Voladores negotiated with the government of Veracruz after the inscription to support fair salaries for master Voladores working as teachers. Migration out of the region has been reversed to some extent through the reorientation of the local economy towards cultural tourism based on Totonac culture and tradition, providing jobs not just for performers and teachers but also in related areas such as accommodation and transport. Tourism is the only source of income for the Voladores in Papantla, which has helped to keep the tradition alive and give younger people a better education. These benefits have been concentrated in Papantla, while in other areas such as Michoacán, the ceremony has almost never been performed for tourists and few bearers remain.

Tourism has also posed challenges for safeguarding in Papantla, however. External stakeholders, including some government and commercial actors, have tended to focus on economic aspects of the ceremony, and not its cultural governance. Voladores seek better working conditions, too. They earn tips, but have no salary or workers’ rights; they are dependent on tourism, but occasionally they perform at fairs or festivals, or government events. The Council of Voladores, a community governance body which is supported by the government of Veracruz, is thus working on a long term plan to ensure that Voladores have decent working conditions respecting their cultural and human rights, including higher income, social security and health insurance. The Council of the Voladores has introduced measures to enable sharing of benefits from tourism and awarding of prizes among the bearers of the tradition.[[27]](#footnote-27)

The performance of the ritual has been adapted and shortened for tourists, effectively creating a separate performance. Although the full ritual ceremony of the Voladores is supposed to take place at specific times of the year and on special occasions, the most spectacular part of the tradition, flying around the pole, is now performed at any time, as an acrobatic act for tourist audiences. Tourist performances generally omit the cutting, selection and ritual preparation of the pole and the ritual preparations of the ‘flyers’ or Voladores. The tourist performances generally use permanently erected steel poles. The use of fixed metal poles affects the meaning of the ritual because spiritual communion is established between the natural and the supernatural world through the ritual selection and preparation of a Tsakáe Kiwi tree for the pole. As ‘professional’ performers emerge to serve the tourist market, they focus on the flight part of the ceremony and hence on physical rather than mental preparation. They may therefore fail to learn some of the traditional techniques for avoiding injury.

Although the performance for tourists does not fully replicate the ritual and its significance, the adaptation of the ceremony for tourists has been managed by the community as a separate kind of event. The Voladores only want to share some of the ceremony with tourists, so they are willing to separate tourist performances from the complete traditional ritual. To ensure that the knowledge is transmitted within their community, they make sure that the entire ceremony is performed by tradition bearers at appropriate times in places such as Veracruz and Puebla, including the rituals associated with raising the pole, and offerings to Mother Earth. Young people are trained to fly in the traditional way, not simply to earn a living but because they are born into that community.

Some commercial companies have misused the heritage of the Voladores after inscription of the element brought greater public visibility, but through unified action and with government support and legal assistance, the community has been able to respond. A beer company used the image of the Voladores to promote their beer in 2016, which was particularly inappropriate as the Voladores avoid alcohol in the course of the ceremony. After extensive consultations, the company agreed on reparations to the Council of Voladores.[[28]](#footnote-28) A loan company also more recently [ridiculed](https://www-lajornadamaya-mx.translate.goog/nacional/174795/indigna-comercial-que-denigra-ritual-de-los-voladores-de-papantla?_x_tr_sl=es&_x_tr_tl=en&_x_tr_hl=en-US&_x_tr_pto=wapp) the Voladores in an advertisement for their services. The Voladores used social media and an online petition to get public support against the company. With legal support, the company was [required](https://www-jornada-com-mx.translate.goog/2021/09/13/cultura/a07n2cul?_x_tr_sl=es&_x_tr_tl=en&_x_tr_hl=en-US&_x_tr_pto=wapp) to make a public apology and to provide [financial recompense](https://www-eleconomista-com-mx.translate.goog/arteseideas/-Secretaria-de-Cultura-defiende-el-Ritual-de-Los-Voladores-20210628-0018.html?_x_tr_sl=es&_x_tr_tl=en&_x_tr_hl=en-US&_x_tr_pto=wapp) for the Voladores safeguarding plan, organized and implemented by the Council of Voladores.

Further information

* Nomination file for the inscription <https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/ritual-ceremony-of-the-voladores-00175>
* Secretary of Culture, ‘La Secretaría de Cultura se pronuncia en contra del uso indebido que la empresa Moneyman hizo de la Ceremonia Ritual de Voladores’, 25 June 2021. See [https://www.gob.mx/cultura/prensa/la-secretaria-de-cultura-se-pronuncia-en-contra-del-uso-indebido-que-la-empresa-moneyman-hizo-de-la-ceremonia-ritual-de-voladores](https://eur02.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.gob.mx%2Fcultura%2Fprensa%2Fla-secretaria-de-cultura-se-pronuncia-en-contra-del-uso-indebido-que-la-empresa-moneyman-hizo-de-la-ceremonia-ritual-de-voladores%3Ffbclid%3DIwAR3Uv8mTcRMqKwyHjUcGXBMpcCV-Q2zDoiTpKXsGr6bHhDLJ2cPzSHPaxO8&data=05%7C01%7Charriet%40conjunction.me.uk%7C540cf8c07dd14a7a233808dae427f77e%7C7c6acbf416ba4831bb61fffd7b03ecf9%7C0%7C0%7C638073157554142602%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=6dGrhwlV217uA3mfsUSeexo4rTMplxHiMxTMDWBksO4%3D&reserved=0" \t "_blank)
* ‘Indigna comercial que denigra ritual de los Voladores de Papantla’, 25 June 2021. La Jornada Maya. See <https://www.lajornadamaya.mx/nacional/174795/indigna-comercial-que-denigra-ritual-de-los-voladores-de-papantla?fbclid=IwAR3cWMjgXwyUecrvYg8R3l6V23NKAZZxJ-UVWUmPBx9H6prGRLhYclUrQoM>
* ‘Secretaría de Cultura defiende el Ritual de Los Voladores’, El Economista, 28 June 2021. See <https://www-eleconomista-com-mx.translate.goog/arteseideas/-Secretaria-de-Cultura-defiende-el-Ritual-de-Los-Voladores-20210628-0018.html>
* ‘El Consejo de Voladores y la Cervecería Cuauhtémoc Moctezuma celebran acuerdo reparatorio’, INAH Bulletin 465, 21 September 2022. <https://inah.gob.mx/boletines/el-consejo-de-voladores-y-la-cerveceria-cuauhtemoc-moctezuma-celebran-acuerdo-reparatorio>

A community organization, state agencies and intellectual property protection supporting Slovenian beekeepers (Slovenia)

State agencies can work with community organizations to provide a range of support in ensuring that economic activities associated with their ICH are appropriately promoted and protected against misappropriation, for example through education and cultural tourism initiatives, foreign policy and collective forms of intellectual property.

In Slovenia, the heritage of beekeeping is associated with a number of economic activities, including breeding Carniolan queen bees, building wooden beehives and apiaries, making beekeeping tools, painting beehive panels, marketing honey and related products, apitherapy and tourism. Slovenia has nearly 11,000 beekeepers, most of whom do it part-time or as a hobby with less than 20 bee colonies. They maintain around 200,000 Carniolan bee colonies kept mainly in locally-designed wooden Alberti-Žnideršič (AŽ) hives, stacked into apiaries. They are organized into over 200 local beekeeping societies, 15 regional societies and the national Slovenian Beekeepers' Association (SBA).

As a community organization, the SBA promotes safeguarding of beekeeping culture by raising public awareness about bees and the heritage of beekeeping, supporting people to learn traditional beekeeping and related skills, and promoting viable livelihoods based on beekeeping tourism and locally-produced products. In about 2006-7, the SBA started a charitable educational campaign called “Slovenian Beekeepers’ Honey for Breakfast in Kindergartens and Schools”, in partnership with schools and government agencies including the Ministry of Agriculture and Environment, the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education, Science and Sports. Initiated with the aim of making schoolchildren aware of the importance of bees and their role in pollination, and to promote honey consumption, the programme was rebranded in 2011 as a Traditional Slovenian Breakfast and later European Honey Breakfast, promoting locally produced food and the benefits of eating breakfast more generally, as well as sustainable environmental management. Beekeepers' associations from the surrounding area collect honey and donate it to kindergartens and schools. On the third Friday in November every year, Slovenian honey is served to the children for breakfast with bread, butter, milk and apples. An educational publication is distributed to children, and beekeepers make presentations and conduct workshops. Officials, athletes and other celebrities participate in the campaign, which is also well supported by the media.

The SBA has worked with other stakeholders to promote apicultural tourism as part of green tourism initiatives in the country. By promoting small-scale boutique experience-based apicultural tourism run by local families, the association aims to support safeguarding and beekeeper livelihoods while avoiding excessive commercialization (over-tourism). The SBA trains providers, including a new category of Api-Guides, focusing on the experience of beekeeping. The small size of apiaries necessitates small visitor groups to beekeeping facilities, but larger groups of visitors can learn to make wax products, paint traditional wooden panels for beehives, buy honey, wax and other products, and visit apitherapists. Apitourism not only benefits beekeepers but also other businesses, such as spas and craft shops, local farmers and restaurants. These are linked into tourism experiences called ‘Apiroutes’, promoting green ecotourism.

The SBA organises consultations and annual meetings on apicultural tourism. It aims to ensure quality by establishing a certification for providers of apitourism tourist services in line with its apicultural tourism strategy (2021-2025). Alongside this, education and quality monitoring processes aim to ensure that beekeepers don’t adopt damaging commercial strategies (such as bee robbing, overuse of toxic treatments, use of metal beehives) that are not in line with beekeeping traditions, ethics or sustainable development. Laws and regulations ensure that only the indigenous Carniolan bee is used for beekeeping in Slovenia.

The Republic of Slovenia has established a Honey Diplomacy project in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, using beekeeping knowledge as a way of promoting equitable global development, poverty eradication, reduction of inequalities and sustainable development in development cooperation and humanitarian aid. Under this project, the Embassy of the Republic of Slovenia in Tehran donated six urban beehives to a school for Afghan girls, children of refugees in Karaj, Iran. Launched in 2019, the project educates street children and children of Afghan refugees about beekeeping and the production of honey and honey products, using cultural cooperation as a way of enhancing future opportunities for economic development.

Beekeeping in the Gorenjska region was included in the ‘Intangible Search’ inventory of the Alpfoodway project, a cross-disciplinary, transnational and participative project exploring ways of promoting and safeguarding Alpine food cultural heritage and associated businesses. Slovenia was a partner country in the project, which emphasized the importance of collective action by a cross-section of local heritage food business and other stakeholders to promote their products in a heritage-sensitive way and ensure fair prices and adequate remuneration. It recommended linking local products to collective marketing and tourism initiatives, using territorial branding, supported by intellectual property protection.

The name ‘Slovenian honey’ is registered as a Geographical Indication in the European Union (PGI). It can only be used to describe honey produced in Slovenia, that meets high quality standards. Honey products from the Kočevje and Karst regions are registered under the Protected Designation of Origin scheme. At a national level, a labelling scheme is available to indicate high quality honey from different regions of the country, for example from Zlati panj (Medex). Beekeepers can also apply for an organic production certificate for their products.

Further information:

* Slovenian Beekeepers‘ Association, European Honey Breakfast and World Bee Day initiative, 2015 <https://www.worldbeeday.org/files/leaflets/Leaflet_EUHoneyBreakfast_and_WorldBeeDay_EN.pdf>
* Traditional Slovenian Breakfast promotion, 2020 <https://www.gov.si/en/news/2020-11-20-traditional-slovenian-breakfast/>
* SBA, European Honey Breakfast [https://www.czs.si/Upload/European\_Honey\_Breakfast.pdf](https://www.czs.si/Upload/European_Honey_Breakfast.pdf%20) Apitourism in Slovenia <https://www.apiturizem.si/en/>
* ‘I feel Slovenia’, promotion of sustainable green tourism experiences <https://www.slovenia.info/en/stories/local-high-quality-brands-in-green-destinations>
* Nomination file no. 01857 for inscription in 2022 on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity: <https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/beekeeping-in-slovenia-a-way-of-life-01857?RL=01857>
* Beekeeping in the Gorenjska region, entry on the Intangible Search inventory <https://www.intangiblesearch.eu/search/show_ich_detail.php?db_name=intangible_search&lingua=inglese&idk=ICH-AFAMB-0000001456>
* Alpfoodway project outcomes <https://www.alpine-space.eu/project/alpfoodway/>
* GI Registration of Slovenski med <https://ec.europa.eu/info/food-farming-fisheries/food-safety-and-quality/certification/quality-labels/geographical-indications-register/details/EUGI00000014346>
* GI Registration of Kraški med <https://ec.europa.eu/info/food-farming-fisheries/food-safety-and-quality/certification/quality-labels/geographical-indications-register/details/EUGI00000013982>

!Khwa ttu: San culture and education centre creating employment opportunities while revitalizing and safeguarding heritage
(South Africa)[[29]](#footnote-29)

Community projects, assisted by donor funding, can use tourism as an opportunity to develop capacity and businesses in rural areas that inspire community members to value and transmit their heritage while earning sustainable livelihoods from it.

The San are an indigenous people located in southern Africa who lived as hunter-gatherers organized in small mobile foraging bands until colonization in the eighteenth century. Since then, they have suffered loss of land, significant levels of persecution and discrimination. Some San communities were employed in the Apartheid-era army as trackers and were forcibly relocated afterwards or switched to farming under government-mandated modernization programs. This disrupted practice and transmission of San living heritage. San communities have also been exploited by the tourism industry, paid poorly, required to act in staged encounters and act as “[wild Bushmen](https://www.culturalsurvival.org/publications/cultural-survival-quarterly/khwa-ttu-san-culture-education-centre)” as recently as the 1990s. The San communities face poverty and disadvantage even today, in spite of some successful land claims, constitutional protections against discrimination and better political representation, for example through San Councils in [Namibia](https://ww2.namibian.com.na/san-communities-launch-council-and-trust/) and [South Africa](https://www.uri.org/who-we-are/cooperation-circle/gauteng-khoi-and-san-council). Recently, the South African San Council has called for the San people to be included more in the [development of tourism programmes](https://www.sabcnews.com/sabcnews/san-council-calls-for-more-inclusion-in-tourism-value-chain/), telling their own stories. The national Department of Sport, Arts and Culture has appointed an advisory group to establish a Khoe and San Heritage Route.

The !Khwa ttu San culture and education centre, based on an 850 hectare nature reserve 70 kilometres north of Cape Town, South Africa, promotes heritage restitution, conservation and responsible tourism with a mission to change public attitudes to San heritage, support the San to reclaim and share their own heritage stories, and help them earn a living from doing so. !Khwa ttu means water pan in one of the San languages (IXam). The !Khwa ttu project was launched in 1999 after a request from WIMSA (the Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa), a non-governmental network that coordinates and represents the interests of Indigenous San peoples throughout southern Africa. Community consultations with San representatives from different countries helped to shape the project. It was supported organizationally and financially by Swiss anthropologist Irene Staehelin and is now a non-profit initiative directed jointly by the San and the Swiss-based Ubuntu Foundation. In 2022, about 60% of its earnings were self-generated through tourist income. The rest of the finance is raised from donors, including the Ubuntu Foundation.

The project combines four main activities that support each other: cultural heritage education, community training, tourism and conservation management based on indigenous knowledge. The project provides practical residential training for young San interns from all over southern Africa to work in the hospitality and heritage industries. Graduates of the programme use their work experience to find employment or identify further training opportunities. Some now work at the centre, leading tours for visitors and in the associated restaurant, shop, guest houses, open air tented camps, and mountain bike trails. The project aims to benefit the San community more generally by building capacity for local tourism projects in the many different rural places where San are currently located. It hopes to serve as an inspiration for other projects combining tourism, heritage and environmental conservation work to strengthen indigenous initiatives in remote communities across southern Africa.

In setting up !Khwa ttu, it was necessary to choose between a location that was closer to current tourist infrastructure, or one that was closer to community members in the semi-arid areas of the Northern Cape Province of South Africa, Namibia and Botswana. Close to Cape Town, the chosen site for the project is located within striking distance of rock shelters with San paintings, a fossil park and archaeological sites, some of which can be visited by the public. The site first opened to the public for tours in 2006, and twelve years later opened a San Heritage Centre. Guides use displays in the Heritage Centre with objects, interviews, interactive maps and stories from all over Southern Africa to communicate the meaning and value of San heritage. The tourism offer is priced to attract local visitors as well as people from abroad. The project attracted about 20,000 visitors by 2022, the majority of whom (70%) come from South Africa.

The project began training young San people in 2005, and by 2022 hosted about 20 interns a year, generally for only six months at a time because of visa constraints. Graduates of the programme do not receive formal certification, but gain skills and work experience during their internships, and are supported to find employment or seek further training or certification. Those who subsequently work at the centre develop business and management skills, as part of the succession plan to develop San leadership for the project. The training itself is also a form of community building, as it brings people from different San communities in the sub-region together. Nashada Ndango, one of the graduates of the programme who now works as a tour guide, explained that, besides the skills and confidence she gained through the programme, she particularly valued meeting her brothers and sisters from other San communities, learning about the differences and similarities in their culture.

The project has developed strong links between the different activities on site, for example through the restaurant, which tells the story of San heritage through traditional foods and plant knowledge, supports local suppliers, and generates income. A period of reflection and planning during COVID-19 lockdowns enabled the team to plan a move away from commercial food suppliers and offer a new menu. This period also created an opportunity to develop stronger connections between the museum displays and tours of the site, for example in the Food of our Ancestors tour. The link between community members, researchers and staff has been an important aspect of its success, even though the San have in the past had negative experiences with unethical researchers. In March 2017, the South African San Council and other stakeholders thus published a [San Code of Research Ethics](https://www.khwattu.org/exhibitions/the-san-code-ethics/), which requires all researchers intending to engage with San communities to commit to four central values, namely fairness, respect, care and honesty, as well as to comply with a simple process of community approval. Today, Heritage Centre staff use a small informal email group to consult with interested community members and researchers about ongoing development of exhibitions and tours.

It remains expensive to transport interns in from many different locations, and those who return home may not find many opportunities in rural areas. The project has thus designed several outreach activities supporting education and tourism initiatives in rural San communities. San makers in the [ǂKhomani Cultural Landscape](https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1545/) in Botswana and Namibia benefit from the project because the centre purchases craft items directly from them, and other community projects, to sell in the shop. The centre is developing a virtual !Khwa ttu museum which will include interviews with community members, research and 'grey literature' about San heritage. It also runs a programme for schools, aimed at strengthening heritage education. The Heritage Centre and graduate interns support tourism, heritage and museum projects in communities, such as the [Khwe Living Museum](https://www.lcfn.info/khwe) in Namibia and the [Kalahari Desert Festival](https://www.kdfest.com/).

Further information:

* !Khwa tuu website <https://www.khwattu.org/>
* ǂKhomani Cultural Landscape <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1545/>

One Master, Thousand Masters (Bir Usta Bin Usta) project (Türkiye)[[30]](#footnote-30)

Public-private partnerships can support safeguarding of ICH by assisting master craftspeople to transmit heritage skills to young entrepreneurs, who establish new businesses based on these skills.

The project ‘One Master Thousand Masters’ (Bir Usta Bin Usta) implemented between 2010 and 2019 a public-private partnership promoted the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage skills by supporting masters in selected endangered crafts to train new apprentices. About 1000 master candidates were trained in 50 vocational courses in 44 cities, held over the course of a decade. The project provided new bearers of endangered crafts with support to earn a living from them, thus supporting the continued viability of the heritage.

The project was a public-private partnership between the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, NGOs and a private insurance company, Anadolu Sigorta, working on a non-profit basis. While the Ministry provided technical assistance, Provincial Directorates of Culture and Tourism coordinated the courses in the selected cities. NGOs organized the courses and trainers determined the content and methodology of the courses. Anadolu Sigorta provided financial support and coordinated communication about the project. İZ TV, a national documentary channel, produced a documentary film of the crafts addressed by the project, as well as a photographic album of the courses. The project has won numerous awards since 2012, including the PRIDA Sustainable Cooperation Award (2019).

In setting up the project, local ICH Boards submitted safeguarding needs assessments, based on consultation with communities, bearers and NGOs, to the Ministry. The project priorities, traditional crafts, cities and trainers were then determined by the Ministry. Branches of traditional craftsmanship were selected from elements which had been inscribed on ICH National Inventory of Türkiye. Among the crafts and regions covered by the project included Edirnekâri Art (traditional painting and varnishing of wood or leather) of Edirne, Kutnu Weaving (a traditional silk-based cloth) of Gaziantep, Glassblowing in Muğla, Oltu Stone Working in Erzurum, Traditional Accordion Boot Making in Aydın, bagpipe making in Artvin, and tilemaking in Kütahya.

Lists of bearers, called Living Human Treasures, and those with Bearers and Practitioners of ICH Cards, were used to select suitable masters as trainers. Attention was given to the selection of suitable and accessible venues for training. Fifteen to 20 trainees were selected for each craft and given free training sessions at three to six-month intervals. The trainees, ranging between 15 and 55 years old, had diverse backgrounds, including students, teachers, sculptors, painters, art teachers, animators, researchers, civil servants, home-makers, and retirees. A certificate of attendance was given by the Ministry of Education to all trainees who successfully completed the course. A micro-loan agreement was negotiated with İşBank under the project so that newly qualified trainees could more easily establish their own businesses to earn livelihoods using their skills. Anadolu Sigorta supported the small businesses by buying corporate gifts from their products and promoting their crafts to business partners internationally. The project thus provided new job opportunities and helped to reduce unemployment.

Further information:

* <https://www.birustabinusta.com.tr/en/one-master-thousand-masters>
* <https://sdgs.un.org/partnerships/bir-usta-bin-usta-one-master-thousand-masters>
* <https://youtu.be/7pqn3sEnTj4>

Multiple economic factors affecting safeguarding: henna cultivation, cultural practices and body painting (Yemen)[[31]](#footnote-31)

ICH practices are frequently affected by economic factors across the entire value chain, from agricultural production generating the raw materials to distribution of the final products. Changing economic and social contexts, and the role of ICH in supporting livelihoods, should be taken into account in determining safeguarding actions and priorities.

The regions of Taiz, Yafaa, Tihama, Lahj and Abyan in Yemen are famous for the cultivation of the henna plant. The leaves, dried and then reduced to powder, are the source of a reddish-brown dye known as henna. Despite the ravages of war, displacement and a decline in living conditions, Yemenis continue to observe life-cycle events, hold celebrations, and perform social obligations. Even if these celebrations have become more modest and shorter during times of conflict, henna rituals are still very important to a wide range of Yemenis of all backgrounds and ages. Henna cultivation, cultural practices and body painting thus remain an important aspect of intangible cultural heritage, as well as an expression of resilience.[[32]](#footnote-32) Henna cultivation and use also offer important economic opportunities for local people.

The Yemeni population uses henna in daily life, for temporary body art and to dye leather, for medicinal and other purposes, and in rituals during festive celebrations and rites of passage.[[33]](#footnote-33) Distinguished by its dark red color, henna is used as a dye for the palms of hands and feet, or for hair and beards. Medically, henna is used to treat scalp problems, cracked feet, headaches or heartburn. It is also used to heal minor wounds or skin diseases such as acne. Mixed with other ingredients, and applied to the body, it makes the skin shiny and smooth.[[34]](#footnote-34) Henna has religious significance too, since it was reportedly used by Prophet Muhammad to dye his beard and head.[[35]](#footnote-35) Yemenis continue to use henna in religious celebrations and weddings. At weddings, henna is generally used to bless the bride and groom with good luck, health and fertility, and to protect them from all harm. The orange henna dye left on the body is a symbol of their recent marriage. On "Henna Day", before the wedding day, family members help the bride and the groom[[36]](#footnote-36) to prepare the henna paste and spread it on their palms. For the bride, a henna artist creates more detailed designs on her hands, feet and face while other women sing Yemeni songs on the transition to married status. During the wedding ceremony, family and friends spread henna paste on the palms of the hands and feet of the bride and groom. Henna is also part of funeral rituals. In some areas of Yemen, the dead are washed with henna water or some of its leaves are put inside the shroud and the grave.[[37]](#footnote-37) Yemenis believe that this helps the deceased to enter paradise. When henna is applied to hands and feet, the decorative art is called *naqsh* (engraving). Each area of Yemen had its distinctive *naqsh* patterns, often reminiscent of decorations on buildings as well as of embroidery patterns on local dresses.

For special occasions, henna artists, called *munqicha* or engravers are employed to do body painting. Henna artists (usually women) derive income from this work. Due to the war, there are many more female-headed households in Yemen and more women have been obliged to enter the workforce because of the death or absence of their partner, financial necessity or forced displacement. Yemen had 4.4 million IDPs (internally displaced persons) out of a population of over 30 million in 2022.[[38]](#footnote-38) Because many women seeking jobs lack sufficient education, skills and experience, humanitarian agencies and NGOs have provided training for women in areas such as sewing, handicraft, hairdressing, and henna.[[39]](#footnote-39) These areas of work, traditionally occupied by women, are quickly learned and enable women to quickly build a business and earn a livelihood. While some reports are very optimistic about the results of such training, one challenge is that the market for the goods or services offered is easily saturated by increased numbers of trainees.[[40]](#footnote-40) Henna art is now practiced by more women, working not just in the homes of specialist engravers, but in hairdressers’ shops.[[41]](#footnote-41) While transmission of the skills has helped to safeguard them, the practice is also changing as a result of a broader practitioner base, many of whom have only just learned the skill. Plastic or paper designs are now being sold in the markets, from which clients have to choose the one that matches their needs.[[42]](#footnote-42)

Because of its cultural significance and use as a cosmetic and dye, the cultivation and marketing of henna provides economic opportunities for farmers in Yemen. Crops like these, which have key significance for rural communities, are often neglected by development agencies in favor of major commodity crops. However, they are often better adapted to fragile and marginal environments, and improve farm biodiversity. In the mid-2000s, Biodiversity International, the Ministry of Agriculture in Yemen and the Yemeni Agricultural Research and Extension Authority worked with local communities at 13 sites spread across three different ecological zones assisting farmers in improving cultivation of henna and other ‘minor’ crops. The project documented traditional knowledge, improved seed supply and increased yields through various interventions. However, in spite of more farmers growing henna, incomes from market sales of henna actually declined during and after the project, because more henna was being sold locally as fresh leaves, and less of it was being dried and exported.[[43]](#footnote-43) Maintaining an appropriate balance between imports and exports remains a key part of ensuring that local farmers, as well as local communities, benefit from henna production and keep it going. However, in 2022 Yemen was the largest importer of henna in the world.[[44]](#footnote-44) It has been very difficult for local henna producers to remain competitive in a market characterized by high levels of imported henna and industrial dyes and colors.

Further information

* GIZ news, ‘Displaced women in Yemen: success through henna art’, 2022. See <https://www.giz.de/en/mediacenter/110638.html>
* UNICEF, Market Assessment IMSEA Programme to identify viable micro-business opportunities for the poorest and marginalized population groups in Amanat al Assimah and Sana’a governorates. <https://www.unicef.org/yemen/media/4061/file/IMSEA%20Market%20Assessment%20Report%20English%20Version.pdf>
* Biodiversity International, Medicinal and aromatic plants improve livelihoods in Yemen, 2012. See <https://www.bioversityinternational.org/fileadmin/_migrated/uploads/tx_news/Medicinal_and_aromatic_plants_improve_livelihoods_in_Yemen_1579.pdf>

Community strategies relating to economic aspects of ICH in Sápmi[[45]](#footnote-45)

The Sámi people are developing community strategies to maximize beneficial use of their cultural resources, safeguarding their heritage, while minimizing individual and collective risks from commercial engagement.

Through their various governance structures, and with community consultation, the Sámi are in the process of developing a holistic and strategic approach to market engagement in regard to their intangible cultural heritage. Their approach, as outlined in the [IMKÁS report](https://sametinget.no/_f/p1/i318e80f8-0075-4ec3-9dfe-0c2a6301ff3e/the-project-intangible-cultural-heritage-in-sapmi-short-report-2021.pdf) for the Sámi Parliamentary Council, is based not merely on ethical grounds such as respect for cultural sensitivities, but on the Sámi people's collective right to ownership and self-determination over their cultural resources. Although legal contexts differ across Sápmi, Sámi rights to land use and self-governance have been acknowledged to some extent under national laws. Sámi Parliaments bear devolved responsibilities, including for culture, in the three Scandinavian countries (Finland, Norway, Sweden). The Sámi Parliaments cooperate with each other under the umbrella of the Sámi Parliamentary Council.

As one of the authors of the IMKÁS report and Sámi legal expert Piia Nuorgam has noted,[[46]](#footnote-46) cultural misappropriation and unauthorized use of cultural resources can be compared to Sámi land being stolen. Sámi-defined cultural resources need to be safeguarded because they define Sámi identity (‘they are what makes us ‘us’, as the Sámi’), manifest Sámi culture and values, and sustain community livelihoods. Economic benefit and intangible cultural heritage safeguarding are not in conflict if Sámi can control what to commercialize and how to commercialize it. The Sámi are thus exploring various forms of collective action to this end.

A number of initiatives have already been undertaken to exert some community control in the marketplace around use of Sámi cultural heritage. The Saami Council, a community-run NGO, works across Sápmi to promote Sámi cultural, political, economic, civil, social and spiritual rights and interests. In 1982, the Saami Council registered a Sámi Duodji trademark to identify traditional handicrafts made by Sámi. They plan to use a new trademark (Sámi Made) to indicate Sámi origin of a broader range of products (not only traditional handicrafts) based on ICH practices.[[47]](#footnote-47) The Sámi Tourism Project is working towards a more responsible and ethically sustainable tourism sector, following the ethical guidelines for Sámi tourism adopted by the Sámi Parliament in Finland in 2018.[[48]](#footnote-48) A 2019 cooperation [agreement](https://www.samediggi.fi/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Agreement_WDAS_SAMI.pdf) was entered into between the Sámi Parliaments and Council and Disney Animation Studios to ensure that use of Sámi cultural resources in the film Frozen 2 was respectful and appropriate, monitored by a Sámi advisory group. The agreement affirmed that these cultural resources are Sámi property and their use requires free, prior and informed consent, as well as adequate benefit sharing.

In 2017, Norway, Sweden and Finland declared their strong support for [UNDRIP](https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/declaration-on-the-rights-of-indigenous-peoples.html), the 2007 United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.[[49]](#footnote-49) Article 31.1 of the Declaration supports Indigenous people’s intellectual property rights over their cultural heritage:

Indigenous peoples have the right to maintain, control, protect and develop their cultural heritage, traditional knowledge and traditional cultural expressions, as well as the manifestations of their sciences, technologies and cultures, including human and genetic resources, seeds, medicines, knowledge of the properties of fauna and flora, oral traditions, literatures, designs, sports and traditional games and visual and performing arts. They also have the right to maintain, control, protect and develop their intellectual property over such cultural heritage, traditional knowledge, and traditional cultural expressions.

There are challenges, however, in using conventional intellectual property frameworks to exert control over cultural resources that are not new and original creations of an individual artist, but passed down through generations in a community. Following on a [report](https://julkaisut.valtioneuvosto.fi/handle/10024/161206) commissioned by the Finnish Ministry of Education and Culture on the needs of the Sámi people for intellectual property protection from the viewpoint of copyright and trademarks and the IMKÁS report mentioned above, [regional cooperation](https://okm.fi/en/project?tunnus=OKM057:00/2020) has been undertaken on the use of intellectual property protection to support Sámi interests in the marketplace, including a November 2021 [conference](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sZ9lA-E3Jdg) in Inari. The safeguarding of Sámi intangible cultural heritage linking safeguarding in commercial and broader contexts such as museums has been further discussed at the [Arctic Arts Summit](https://arcticartssummit.ca/accueil/) and a [Trondheim](https://kulturdirektoratet.no/kalender/hendelse/-/nordisk-konferanse-om-samisk-immateriell-kulturarv) conference in 2022.

This work has indicated that while Sámi intangible cultural heritage resources, and innovations based on them, can give Sámi businesses a competitive advantage, those using cultural resources for livelihoods continue to experience many challenges. These challenges have individual and collective dimensions, balancing economic and cultural considerations. They also have structural causes, arising partly from colonial histories and weak control over the use of cultural resources in the market, coupled with increased market pressures driving cultural appropriation today. Many Sámi businesses suffer from lack of capital investment. In some cases, economic and cultural, as well as individual and collective priorities, may clash and interests may diverge. Practitioners may not be able to identify a single ‘correct’ or ‘ethical’ course of action. It is difficult to establish fixed rules for practitioner engagement with the market, and where there is wide disagreement, this may create conflict. It is sometimes difficult to identify possible risks and impacts from business actions. To build consensus and guide action, discussion forums for Sámi businesspeople have been used to develop collective recommendations, for example on appropriate consumer use of handicrafts, to ensure that this safeguards the associated heritage.

Interventions to assist Indigenous businesses and to enforce collective rights using a rights-based approach could in future be managed by a central Sámi body or point of contact to engage both with Sámi entrepreneurs and third parties, This could assist entrepreneurs, register rights protection, and enforce Sámi rights where necessary.[[50]](#footnote-50) The Sámi also seek more effective action by government and public cultural institutions to create supportive policies for Indigenous businesses, including business support, revision of IP laws, museum programming and collections access protocols.

Further information

* Arctic Arts Summit webinar ‘Practitioners experiences in the traditional arts economy, 9 June 2022’, <https://www.kulturdirektoratet.no/web/guest/kalender/hendelse/-/practitioners-experiences-in-the-traditional-arts-economy>
* Webinar 3-4 November 2022 https://kulturdirektoratet.no/kalender/hendelse/-/nordisk-konferanse-om-samisk-immateriell-kulturarv
* Aslat Holmberg, 2022 ‘Working towards ethical guidelines for research involving the Sámi’, [https://lcipp.unfccc.int/sites/default/files/2022-06/Working towards ethical guidelines for research involving the Sami\_0.pdf](https://lcipp.unfccc.int/sites/default/files/2022-06/Working%20towards%20ethical%20guidelines%20for%20research%20involving%20the%20Sami_0.pdf)
1. This document was prepared by the consultant Harriet Deacon, in collaboration with the UNESCO Living Heritage Entity and with inputs from the Peer Review Panel on economic aspects of intangible cultural heritage safeguarding. It is presented as a preliminary draft for the purpose of discussion and review. The content does not necessarily reflect the institutional views of UNESCO and is subject to revisions based on peer feedback. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. This case study summarizes information from the articles Lingard and Martin (2016) and Lingard et al. (2021). Thanks to Kylie Lingard (University of Wollongong) for her assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Australia, Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet 2018. *Celebrating Indigenous Cultures: Closing the Gap*. Prime Minister’s Report, p.23. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Terri Janke and Company 1999. *Our Culture Our Future: Report on Australian Indigenous Cultural and Intellectual Property Rights*. Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies and the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. See Terri Janke and Company website, Setting up for success: bushfoods <https://www.terrijanke.com.au/setting-up-for-success-bushfoods> [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Janke, Terri, 2019. True tracks: Indigenous cultural and intellectual property principles for putting self-determination into practice. PhD dissertation, Australian National University. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. See Interim Report: Scoping Study on stand-alone legislation to protect and commercialise Indigenous

Knowledge <https://consultation.ipaustralia.gov.au/policy/stand-alone-legislation-for-indigenous-knowledge/user_uploads/ik-scoping-study-interim-reportoct.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Thanks to Giovanny Arteaga (Mundo Espiral Foundation) and Alexander Peña Parra (Artesanías de Colombia) for their assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Traditional knowledge and techniques associated with Pasto Varnish mopa-mopa of Putumayo and Nariño (Colombia), inscribed on the USL in 2020 (15.COM) <https://ich.unesco.org/en/USL/traditional-knowledge-and-techniques-associated-with-pasto-varnish-mopa-mopa-of-putumayo-and-nario-01599> [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. [**Decision 15.COM 8.A.1**](https://ich.unesco.org/en/decisions/15.COM/8.A.1) para.2 U.2 and para. 3 U.3. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. See <https://artesaniasdecolombia.com.co/PortalAC/General/template_index.jsf> [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Artesanias de Chile travel guides <https://artesaniasdechile.cl/category/revista-digital/guias-de-viaje/?v=5bc574a47246> [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. See <https://artjameel.org/heritage/cairo/> [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. See <https://artjameel.org/heritage/jeddah/> [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. See <https://artjameel.org/about/history/> [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. See <https://artjameel.org/heritage/preserving-the-future/> [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. See <https://artjameel.org/heritage/ateliercairo/> [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. See <https://www.alj.com/en/news/new-product-design-module-at-the-jameel-house-in-jeddah-prepares-traditional-artisans-for-the-market/> [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. See <https://www.milleworld.com/art-jameel-coronavirus-grant/> [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. See <https://artjameel.org/projects/art-jameel-research-and-practice-platform/> [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Thanks to Ana Shanshiashvili (Georgian Heritage Crafts Association) for her assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Thanks to Frances Potter (The New Basket Workshop), Gregory MacCarthy (The Baba Tree) and Palash Singh (NID) for their assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. The G-lish Foundation and ATAG are no longer operating as NGOs. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. Thanks to the HIPAMS team for the information in this case study (www.hipams.org) [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. See <https://www.puruliachau.com/> [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Thanks to Salomón Bazbaz Lapidus (founder of the Centre for Indigenous Arts) for his assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. See <https://www.lajornadamaya.mx/opinion/175492/los-voladores-la-fuerza-aerea-espiritual-de-mexico> [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. See <https://inah.gob.mx/boletines/el-consejo-de-voladores-y-la-cerveceria-cuauhtemoc-moctezuma-celebran-acuerdo-reparatorio> [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Thanks to Michael Daiber, Chris Low and Magdalena Lukas, among others, at !Khwa ttu who assisted with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Thanks to Evrim Ölçer Özünel (Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University, Ankara) for her assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. Thanks to Annie Tabet (University of St Joseph of Beirut) for her assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. ACAPS Analysis Hub, YEMEN Life goes on in Yemen: Conversations with Yemeni families as the war nears its eighth year, Thematic report 22 May 2022, <https://www.acaps.org/sites/acaps/files/products/files/20220522_acaps_yemen_analysis_hub_coping_strategies_0.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Schönig H., « Le corps et les rites de passage chez les femmes du Yémen », *Revue des mondes musulmans et de la Méditerranée* [online], 113-114 | 2006. URL: <http://journals.openedition.org/remmm/2974> DOI : <https://doi.org/10.4000/remmm.2974> [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Al-Chotiri M., “Yemeni Henna”, *Al-Watan,* 21-02-2018 (Arabic).

<https://www.al-watan.com/article/127871/LASTPAGE/> [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. Al-Shabab net, “"Henna": an ancient Yemeni folklore with special rituals, customs and various uses (special report)”, 12-12-2020. (Arabic) <https://yemenshabab.net/reports/61958> [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Mohsen O., “Henna is not exclusive to women in Yemen”, *Eremnews*, 8-5-2017. (Arabic)

https://www.eremnews.com/entertainment/society/830584 " [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Qassem F., “Henna in Yemen: Decoration, Rituals and Legends”, *Almushahid*, 12-11-2018. (Arabic)

[https://almushahid.net/35809/#](https://almushahid.net/35809/) [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. GIZ news, ‘Displaced women in Yemen: success through henna art’, 2022. See <https://www.giz.de/en/mediacenter/110638.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Heinze, M. and Stevens, S. (2018), “Women as Peacebuilders in Yemen”, Social Development Direct and Yemen Polling Center.”

<https://www.yemenpolicy.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/YPCPublications_Report-Women-as-Peacebuliders-in-Yemen-June-2018.pdf>; UNICEF, Market Assessment IMSEA Programme to identify viable micro-business opportunities for the poorest and marginalized population groups in Amanat al Assimah and Sana’a governorates.

<https://www.unicef.org/yemen/media/4061/file/IMSEA%20Market%20Assessment%20Report%20English%20Version.pdf>; [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. USAID, Yemen Gender Analysis 2020. BANYAN GLOBAL, January 30, 2020

<https://banyanglobal.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/GITA-II-USAID-Yemen-Gender-Analysis-30-January-2020-DEC-version-No-Track-Changes-1.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. ACAPS Analysis Hub, op.cit. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Al-Aghbary A., “Body engraving a profession that attracts girls in Yemen during the war”, *Al-Quds Al-Arabi,* 23-12-2017. (Arabic)

<https://www.alquds.co.uk/> [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. Biodiversity International, Medicinal and aromatic plants improve livelihoods in Yemen, 2012. See <https://www.bioversityinternational.org/fileadmin/_migrated/uploads/tx_news/Medicinal_and_aromatic_plants_improve_livelihoods_in_Yemen_1579.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. These figures are from 7 Feb 2022, based on Volza's Yemen Import data of Henna powder <https://www.volza.com/p/henna-powder/import/import-in-yemen/> [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Thanks to Silja Somby and Siri Wernberg of the Sámi Parliament (Norway) for their assistance with this case study. [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. Nuorgam, Piia 2022. presentation at Arctic Arts Summit webinar ‘Practitioners experiences in the traditional arts economy, 9 June 2022. See <https://www.kulturdirektoratet.no/web/guest/kalender/hendelse/-/practitioners-experiences-in-the-traditional-arts-economy> [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. See Saami Council website <https://www.saamicouncil.net/en/the-sami-duodji-certificate>; <https://www.saamicouncil.net/news-archive/smiri-almmustahtt-smi-duodji-ja-smi-made-mearkkaid-d78cb-3aket> [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Sámi Tourism Project Aims at Building a Responsible and Ethically Sustainable

Sámi Tourism Collaboration Network <https://www.samediggi.fi/2021/10/26/sami-tourism-project-aims-at-building-a-responsible-and-ethically-sustainable-sami-tourism-collaboration-network/?lang=en> [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Nordic-Baltic Statement on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, 29 September 2017. Accessed at <https://www.norway.no/en/missions/wto-un/nig/statements/hr/hrc/hrc36/nordic-baltic-statement/> [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. Nuorgam, Piia 2022. presentation at Arctic Arts Summit webinar ‘Practitioners experiences in the traditional arts economy, 9 June 2022. See <https://www.kulturdirektoratet.no/web/guest/kalender/hendelse/-/practitioners-experiences-in-the-traditional-arts-economy> [↑](#footnote-ref-50)