**CONVENTION FOR THE SAFEGUARDING OF THE
INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE**

**Training of trainers on living heritage and sustainable urban development**

**Strengthening capacities for resilient communities through sustainable Tourism and Heritage Safeguarding in Latin America and the Caribbean**

**5, 7, 19, 27, 28 March and 1 April 2025
Online**

**Unit 3 – Practical approach to safeguarding living heritage in urban contexts**

**Handout 3**

© UNESCO 2025

The images of this working document do not fall under the CC-BY-SA licence and may not be used, reproduced, or commercialized without the prior permission of the copyright holders.

The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this working document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The ideas and opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors; they are not necessarily those of UNESCO and do not commit the Organization.

unit 3

# **HANDOUT 3 – EXAMPLES OF TOOLKIT APPLICATION. THE CULTURE OF THE HAWKER CENTER IN SINGAPORE**

# This document is intended as an example on how the proposed tools for the incorporation of Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) into urban planning can be done in a practical manner. In that regard, the purpose is to give readers a clearer idea of how to populate the templates provided for each tool. No instructions are provided for Tool 1 (Mechanisms for effective coordination and participation) as it is a step that is subject to the geographic, social and institutional context of every ICH element and the example provided here is for illustrative purposes.

# Note: The information contained in this example is for illustrative purposes, and therefore it is not exhaustive nor has been provided by stakeholders directly involved in the ICH element in question.

# **TOOL 2: IDENTIFICATION OF INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE ELEMENTS**

|  |
| --- |
| **Element documentation** |
| **Element name** | Hawker Centers' food vendor culture in Singapore and culinary practices in a multicultural urban context |
| **Physical location** |
| City and country | Singapore, Singapore |
| Coordinates | N/A |
| Element scale | Region (all island) |
| *Location map**Source: Google Earth Pro* |
| **Brief description** | The culture of food vendors at Hawker Centers in Singapore is a living heritage shared by those who prepare and consume the food and mingle around the food in community kitchens called Hawker Centers.Food vendors at Hawker Centers have evolved over time in Singapore. From the street vendors of the past, the current generation are individuals who prepare food in fixed stalls at Hawker Centers. There are approximately 6,000 vendors of different ages, genders and ethnicities working in this practice. Each center is represented by a vendor association or a representative. A non-profit organization, the Federation of Merchants' Associations of Singapore (FMAS) works with street vendors' associations and representatives to defend the interests of vendors and safeguard their culture.In Singapore there are hundreds of food stalls in Hawker Centers from different cultures. Stalls are usually lined up on either side of the center, with an open communal dining space in the middle. Most of the sales centers are located in housing developments and public housing areas (where more than 80% of the population lives) and function as "community kitchens". They function as important community spaces that are frequented by diverse communities residing in Singapore throughout the day. The centers are also located in commercial and recreational districts, where people work and gather.Community organizations, NGOs, educational institutions, public and private sectors, as well as individuals, including overseas Singaporeans, are involved in the practice and protection of street vendor culture. |
| **Associated elements** |
| Tangible *(if any)* | N/A |
| Intangible *(if any)* | N/A |
| **Transmission modes** | In vendor families, culinary practices are transmitted orally or through practical experience, when younger vendors learn from their elders. Some vendors may also hire apprentices from outside the family, who are taught culinary skills and how to run the stall.Local academia and local food advocates (individuals passionate about food heritage) are involved in documenting and transmitting the culinary practices and food preparation knowledge associated with the vendors' culture in publications, videos and blogs.There are formal training programs for the transmission of vendor culture. For example, the Institute of Technical Education (ITE) offers vocational courses, training students in skills related to sales practice. Community centers located in various neighborhoods offer programs such as the "Hawker Fare Series," where street vendors impart culinary knowledge and skills to those aspiring to join the practice. |
| **Participants** | **Name** | **Role** |
| Participant 1 | Vendors | People preparing food at fixed stalls at Hawker Centers. There are approximately 6,000 vendors of different ages, genders and ethnicities working in this practice. |
| Participant 2 | Federation of Merchants Associations | It works with vendors' associations and their representatives to defend vendors' interests and safeguard their culture. |
| Participant 3 | National Environment Agency | Agency in charge of all regulations of the activities at the Hawker Centers. |
| Participant 4 | Housing Development Board | Entity owning 75% of the real estate for Hawker Centers. |
| Participant 5 | Population | The people of Singapore, regardless of gender, age, ethnicity, religion or social status, have continued to eat at street stalls for generations. More than 80% of the population visits street stalls at least once a week. |

# **TOOL 3: ANALYSIS OF THE CORRESPONDENCE OF INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE ELEMENTS TO THE URBAN PLANNING STRUCTURES**

|  |
| --- |
| **Mapping of the element with urban structures** |
| **Ecological** | **Y/N** | **Justification 1** |
| **Biological** | Flora | N | N/A |
| Fauna | N | N/A |
| **Physical** | Soil | N | N/A |
| Water | N | N/A |
| Land | N | N/A |
| Weather | N | N/A |
| **Functional** | **Y/N** | **Justification** |
| **Mobility** | Railroad | Y | Rail connectivity (Mass Rapid Transit) to and from the Hawker Centers is important to ensure adequate access to these destinations throughout the city. |
| Motorized | Y | Road access to and from the Hawker Centers is required to allow for efficient supply logistics and emergency transportation services. |
| Non-motorized | Y | Walking and cycling connectivity to the Hawker Centers is vital to ensure adequate access to these destinations from surrounding housing developments, and to ensure road safety for people. |
| Water | N | N/A |
| Air | N | N/A |
| Other | N | N/A |
| **Public space** | Street/sidewalk | Y | Accessibility to the Hawker Centers requires adequate walking infrastructure to ensure smooth and safe mobility. |
| Park/green area | N/A |  |
| Plaza | N/A |  |
| Other - Street vendor centers | N | Vendor culture is practiced within buildings (Hawker Centers) that must be designed appropriately and address different needs of diverse community members (e.g., barrier-free access, lower height tables and chairs for children, etc.) |
| **Utilities** | Electricity | Y | Adequate and reliable power supply is required to ensure safe and efficient operation of food stalls. |
| Gas | Y | Adequate and reliable gas supply is required to ensure safe and efficient operation of food stalls. |
| Water/sanitation | Y | Adequate water and sanitation infrastructure and supply is required to ensure safe and efficient operation of the Hawker Centers and an adequate customer experience. |
| Waste management | Y | The Hawker Centers have tested new technology for recycling food waste into compost for gardening or water for cleaning the centers themselves. |
| Communications | Y | More and more vendors have begun to leverage technology and adopt digital services to maintain their sales; some have managed to maintain their reputation through social networks, blogs and online magazines. |
| Other | N | N/A |
| **Urban equipment** | Education | N | N/A |
| Health | N | N/A |
| Culture | N | N/A |
| Recreation | N | N/A |
| Other | N | N/A |
| **Socioeconomic** | **Y/N** | **Justification** |
| **Demographic** | Age | Y | Some of the oldest vendors started their activity in the 1960s. Many of them specialize in a particular dish and perfect the recipe over many years. They also pass on their recipes, knowledge and skills to younger family members or apprentices. More than half of today's vendors are second and third generation. |
| Gender | N | N/A |
| Ethnicity | Y | There are approximately 6,000 vendors of different ages, genders and ethnicities working in this practice in the centers. |
| Migration | Y | Many of the vendors' dishes have their origins in the culinary cultures of the various immigrant groups that settled in Singapore. Over time, they have evolved into distinctive local dishes and an important part of Singapore's culinary heritage. |
| **Economic** | Specific income group | N | N/A |
| Employment | Y | Street trading is and has been a form of employment for many individuals and families for generations. |
| Revenue generation | Y | The vendor culture provides stable direct income to more than 6,000 vendors. |
| **Built heritage** | **Y/N** | **Justification** |
| **Scale** | Monument | N | N/A |
| Building | Y | The culture of street vendors is practiced inside buildings that should be designed accordingly. This scale is relevant when establishing standards for the design of the centers. |
| Block, square or street | N | N/A |
| District or neighborhood | Y | Most of the centers are located within public housing developments and, therefore, should be considered at this planning scale to ensure adequate connectivity and accessibility and compatible uses within the urban context. |
| Region | Y | There are more than 110 Hawker Centers throughout the city. It is important to take this scale into account, especially in the city's Master Plan, to ensure the proper location and distribution of centers in the city. |

1. ***Justification:*** *To explain why and how each identified component of the urban structures relates to or influences (positively or negatively) the ICH element.*

# **TOOL 4: MAPPING OF THREATS AND BENEFITS CONCERNING THE SAFEGUARDING OF THE ELEMENTS**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Hazards**  | **Y/N** | **Justification1** |
| **Changes in land use** | Y | A strictly economic approach to urban development may view the Hawker Centers as sites with potential for higher economic return uses, which in turn may influence land use changes to allow for more intensive real estate development. |
| **Destruction of spaces** | N | N/A |
| **Rapid urbanization alters lifestyles** | Y | Currently, the role of food vendor at Hawker Centers is not well regarded by the population as a profession or livelihood. Given the growing career aspirations of young people, this activity is often considered less attractive compared to others. |
| **Migration (inward or outward)** | N | N/A |
| **Pressure on infrastructure** | Y | The potential increase in demand for food in these centers may exceed the installed capacity of the infrastructure, which may affect the quality and operation of the centers, and people's experience. |
| **Inadequate housing** | N | N/A |
| **Unemployment or low income** | Y | Revenue margins for many vendors have declined and are generally lower than those of other food and beverage establishments. This may discourage young populations from continuing to practice this activity. |
| **Industrialization** | N | N/A |
| **Lack of public spaces** | N | N/A |
| **Consumerism/materialism** | Y | Changes in consumption trends may threaten Hawker Center culture through negative perceptions of traditional cultural practices and through a shift in demand toward more commercialized food offerings. In addition, there are more and more food and beverage outlets in Singapore, creating more competition for Hawker Centers. |
| **New technology** | N | N/A |
| **Globalization (homogenization)** | Y | Globalization may threaten vendor culture through the monopolization of stalls by large transnational business entities rather than individuals. |
| **Land appropriation**  | N | N/A |
| **Climate change and natural disasters**  | N | N/A |
| **Food shortages or unaffordability** | Y | The costs of raw materials and other inputs have exceeded vendors' food prices. Profit margins for many vendors have declined. Some vendors have adapted and have increased the sale of their premium dishes, which may make the vendors' offerings less affordable in the long run. |
| **Armed conflict and displacement** | N | N/A |
| **Other - Aging population** | Y | More than half of today's salespeople are second- and third-generation (the average age of salespeople is 59), which can threaten the transmission of recipes, knowledge and skills to younger family members or apprentices. |

1. ***Justification:*** *explain why and how each identified threat may jeopardize the safeguarding of the ICH element, and especially if and how each threat relates to urban structures.*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Benefits**  | **Y/N** | **Justification1** |
| **Social cohesion and welfare** | Y | Most Hawker Centers are located in public housing centers and function as "soup kitchens". The centers remain an accessible experience for communities, and are extensions of the home where social cohesion is strengthened. |
| **Informal social support structures** | N | N/A |
| **Intergenerational communication** | Y | The culture of the vendors is manifested in the fact that they maintain culinary practices that have been passed down from generation to generation. Vendors pass on their recipes, knowledge and skills to younger family members or apprentices. |
| **Sense of identity** | Y | The vendor culture fosters a common national identity based on shared experiences, values and norms and represents Singapore's multicultural heritage. |
| **Intra- and inter-community tolerance** | Y | Hawker Centers function as community spaces that are frequented by diverse communities residing in Singapore throughout the day. Multicultural exchanges in these spaces are commonplace, fostering greater tolerance. |
| **Protection of local economies** | Y | The vendor culture provides stable livelihoods for the vendors and affordable meals for the population. |
| **Sustainable livelihoods** | Y | This activity is a factor of social and economic leveling, accessible to people of different ethnicities, social origins, religions and cultures. It provides stable livelihoods for vendors. There are approximately 6,000 street vendors of different ages, genders and ethnicities working in this practice. |
| **Urban regeneration** | N | N/A |
| **Environmental protection** | N | N/A |
| **Urban-rural integration** | N | N/A |
| **Risk preparedness** | N | N/A |
| **Other (specify)** | N | N/A |

1. ***Justification:*** *explain why and how each identified benefit can result from the protection of the ICH*

# **TOOL 5: IDENTIFICATION OF SAFEGUARDING MEASURES FOR LIVING HERITAGE ELEMENTS**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | **Strategic actions to safeguard an ICH element** |
| **Threat 1** | **Strategic actions 4** | **Expected profit 5** |
| # | Urban structure 2 | Scale 3 | Type | Description |
| **Changes in land use** | 1 | Functional | Regional | Preserve | Considering that some Hawker Centers **may have potential for higher return on investment uses from a real estate and economic perspective, land use planning can help preserve existing centers in the medium and long term to help protect this cultural practice.**  | * Social cohesion and welfare
* Sustainable livelihoods
* Intergenerational communication
* Sense of identity
* Intra- and inter-community tolerance
* Protection of local economies
 |
| 2 | Functional | Regional | Supply | Given the growing demand for food in some centers, **modifications to the land use plan may be considered to provide additional land for the construction of new centers** in the medium and long term. | * Social cohesion and welfare
* Sustainable livelihoods
* Intergenerational communication
* Sense of identity
* Intra- and inter-community tolerance
* Protection of local economies
 |
| **Unemployment or low income** | 3 | Socioeconomic | Regional | Supply | As the vendors' income margins shrink due to the rising costs of raw materials and other costs of raw materials and other inputs, **a policy to keep stall rents affordable could be devised and implemented** to help improve the financial viability of vendors. | * Sustainable livelihoods
* Protection of local economies
 |
| 4 | Socioeconomic | Regional | Improve | **Improve food waste recycling initiatives at food waste centers and incorporate waste recycling systems** both for sustainability purposes and as an additional source of income for street vendors. | * Sustainable livelihoods
 |
| **Consumerism or materialism** | 5 | Functional | Building | Improve | In the face of increasing competition from food and beverage establishments, measures to **improve the physical attractiveness and comfort of food and beverage facilities** could help improve the overall perception, such as better spacing of aisles and tables to minimize overcrowding, installation of fans to improve ventilation, and improved sanitary facilities. | * Social cohesion and welfare
* Intergenerational communication
* Sense of identity
* Intra- and inter-community tolerance
 |
| 6 | Functional | Regional | Adjust | **Review and evaluate possible adjustments to land uses within the Hawker Center catchment areas to manage competition** from new food and beverage establishments through more compatible uses in the vicinity of the Hawker Centers. | * Sustainable livelihoods
* Protection of local economies
 |
| **Globalization (homogenization)** | 7 | Socioeconomic | Regional | Improve | **Improving the operation of privately operated stalls** through expedited licensing and reduced fees at Hawker Centers | * Sustainable livelihoods
* Protection of local economies
 |
| **Food shortage or unaffordability** | 8 | N/A | N/A | N / A | No planning interventions have been identified. | N / A |
| **Other - Aging population** | 9 | N / A | N / A | N / A | No planning interventions have been identified. | N / A |

1. ***Threat: From step 3, identify the applicable threats that could jeopardize the protection of the element.***
2. ***Urban structures:*** *Relate each hazard to the corresponding urban structure: ecological (biological and physical components); functional (transportation/mobility, public spaces, public services, urban facilities); and socioeconomic (demographic and economic factors, and creative economies).*
3. ***Scale:*** *Identify the relevant planning scale at which the threat to the safeguarding of the ICH element could best be mitigated: monument, building, block, square or street, district or neighborhood, or region.*
4. ***Strategic actions:*** *Description of the type of actions that could be implemented to incorporate the ICH element into the planning process and mitigate potential threats to its protection. The type of actions may include: providing something that is currently lacking; preserving something that exists and works well; improving something that exists but can be improved; or adjusting something that exists but needs to be changed.*
5. ***Expected direct benefit:*** *relate each strategic action to the benefits identified in Step 3 and that may result from advancing each action.*

# **TOOL 6: IDENTIFICATION OF URBAN PLANNING MECHANISMS TO SAFEGUARD LIVING HERITAGE ELEMENTS**

|  |
| --- |
| **Planning mechanisms or measures** |
| **Strategic action 1** | **Mechanism or measure 2** | **Description 3** |
| 1 | **Land use planning can preserve existing Hawker Centers** | * Zoning
* Zoning code
 | The 2019 Singapore Master Plan shows the permitted land use and density for developments in the city and therefore indicates areas used or intended for commercial uses, including Hawker Center. Future zoning amendments and the Master Plan zoning code could help preserve existing Hawker Centers sites. The Master Plan is reviewed every five years and translates the long-term strategies of the Long Range Plan into detailed plans that guide land and property development, so that they could also incorporate appropriate zoning measures to continue to preserve the food vendor culture. |
| 2 | **Consider modifications to the land use plan to provide additional land for the construction of new centers** | * Zoning
* Zoning code
 | The Master Plan and Long Range Plan, as well as accompanying detailed plans, may consider new sites for street vendor centers to address potential increased demand and competition. Modifications to these plans could continue to prioritize vendor culture as the main objective of land use planning in the city. |
| 3 | **Implement a policy to keep vendor stall rents affordable** | * Zoning
* Zoning code
* Public financing
* Multilevel/sectoral coordination
 | The Master Plan, Long Range Plan and accompanying detailed plans can also help identify areas of the city where land prices and rents have increased or could increase significantly and affect the viability of vendors. Accordingly, a policy could be designed and implemented to keep stall rents affordable in selected areas. In addition, a rental subsidy scheme could be introduced to ensure the financial viability of such a policy in the medium and long term. The latter may require effective multi-sectoral coordination between relevant ministries and departments (e.g., the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Agriculture, and the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry). Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Economy and Enterprise, Ministry of National Development-URA, to ensure buy-in and collaboration of public sector stakeholders. |
| 4 | **Improve food waste recycling initiatives in the centers and incorporate waste recycling systems** | * Physical interventions
* Social participation
* Public financing
* Private financing
* Incentives
* Technical assistance
 | Physical interventions can be planned, designed and implemented to introduce food waste recycling systems in the centers as a means to ensure a more sustainable operation and provide an additional source of income for vendors. Interventions may include the installation of recycling garbage cans and adequate disposal and collection areas at each center and could be implemented through a public-private financing mechanism. Financial incentives can also be considered to encourage vendors to increase the volume of waste recycled. Involving vendors in the design and implementation of interventions can ensure greater acceptance and operational efficiency. Technical assistance on waste management processes can be provided to vendors as additional support. |
| 5 | **Improving the physical attractiveness and comfort of the centers**  | * Physical interventions
* Social participation
* Public financing
* Private financing
 | Physical interventions, such as more spacing between aisles and tables to minimize crowding, installation of fans to improve ventilation, and provision of more and better sanitary facilities, could help improve perception and comfort in the centers. These interventions could be financed through a public-private mechanism. Involving vendors and users in the design and implementation of interventions can ensure greater acceptance and efficiency. |
| 6 | **Review and evaluate possible adjustments to land uses within the catchment areas of street vending centers to manage increased competition** | * Zoning
* Zoning code
 | The Master Plan, Long Range Plan and accompanying detailed plans could help identify areas of the city where excessive competition (from food and beverage establishments) may threaten the viability of existing centers. Accordingly, the Master Plan could adjust the intensity of competing commercial uses against these spaces within the catchment areas (e.g., an 800 m or 10-minute walking radius) of the selected Hawker Centers to manage increased competition. |
| 7 | **Improve the operation of stalls by private individuals.** | * Multilevel/sectoral coordination
* Incentives
 | To incentivize the opening or preservation of street vendor stalls by individuals, relevant ministries and departments (e.g., MND-URA, MSE) can coordinate and implement a strategy to streamline the process of obtaining the required operating licenses and consider reducing operating fees at certain centers as an incentive for individual vendors. |

1. ***Strategic action:*** *refers to all actions identified in step 4 that could help mitigate threats or maximize the benefits of protecting the ICH element.*
2. ***Tool or mechanism:*** *Physical (interventions related to the ecological or functional structure of a city); Legal (zoning; zoning code); Institutional (social participation; multilevel/sectoral coordination; technical assistance); Financial (public, e.g., direct investment, subsidy; incentives, e.g., taxes; private, e.g., direct investment, PPP).*
3. ***Description:*** *Narrative explanation of the types of tools and mechanisms that will be used to advance each action to incorporate the ICH element into the planning process and how to do so. Multiple tools or mechanisms can be considered for each action.*

# **TOOL 7: SUMMARY OF ACTIONS TO SAFEGUARD LIVING HERITAGE ELEMENTS THROUGH URBAN PLANNING**

The steps to be taken to contribute to the protection of the Culture of Hakwer Center in Singapore through urban planning measures are as follows:

* **Ensure that the current Master Plan, Long Range Plan and applicable detailed plans are aligned with the goal of preserving existing Hawker Centers,** and that future modifications to these plans respect the use of current sites for this practice. It is felt that the Urban Regeneration Authority (URA) can play a leadership role in maintaining the preservation of these sites as a primary objective of land use plans.
* **It is recommended that the URA consider possible modifications to the Master Plan, Long Range Plan and applicable detailed plans to provide additional land for the construction of new Hawker Centers** in the medium and long term in order to address the potential increased demand for food these spaces and contribute to the protection of the food vendor culture in the long term.
* **Consider designing and implementing a policy to help keep stall rents affordable, especially in areas where land prices and rents may increase** in the medium to long term due to real estate trends. Such a policy can help improve the financial viability of these businesses and encourage current and future vendors to continue this practice.
* **Improve food waste recycling initiatives at stalls and incorporate food waste recycling systems to ensure more sustainable stall operations and provide a new source of income for vendors,** especially in the face of reduced revenue margins resulting from increased costs. It is considered important to involve key stakeholders in the design and implementation process, especially vendors, to incorporate their opinions and recommendations, which can help ensure a higher success rate of these measures. These are physical interventions that could be implemented through public-private mechanisms between relevant ministries or departments and individual vendors or associations.
* **Improving the physical attractiveness and convenience of the centers can help them better compete with other food and beverage offerings in nearby areas.** These are physical interventions that could be implemented through public-private mechanisms between relevant ministries or departments and individual vendors or vendor associations, and include, among other possible interventions, improved spacing, ventilation, and sanitation facilities.
* **Review and evaluation of possible adjustments to land uses within the Hawker Center catchment areas could help to better manage increased competition from food and beverage establishments.** It is recommended that the URA evaluate the economic, social and political feasibility of reducing food and beverage uses near the Hawker Centers that may jeopardize the viability of the Hawker Centers. If feasible, this measure could be incorporated into the Master Plan, Long Range Plan and detailed plans.
* **Private stall activity could be encouraged by creating faster processes for obtaining operating licenses and reducing operating fees, if feasible.** Individual vendors pass on their recipes, knowledge and skills to younger family members and apprentices, and their continued participation in this cultural practice is important for its safeguarding.